

states that the first Hudson's Bay Company post opened in Masset in 1869. A good editor would have caught these and other similar discrepancies before the book went to press.

Errors of terminology create minor problems. In the introductory pages, MacDonald is careful to use the term "lineage" for the named Haida matrilineal units, but later he reverts to Swanton's "families," a vague and incorrect label for social groupings generally regarded as matrilineages. The author also incorrectly translates the Haida term for mortuary pole (*xat*) as "grandfather;" the correct translation is "father" (female speaking) which bespeaks the importance of father's lineage in Haida rituals of death.

It is this reviewer's impression that both author and publisher were ambivalent about the type of book *Haida Monumental Art* should be. It can be considered a "coffee table" book given its oversize dimensions, limited edition status, sketches by Bill Reid, and colour photographs of Ninstints (which are, by the way, an aesthetic disappointment). Or as the first and only methodical documentation of houses and totem poles in all the major Haida villages, the book is a potentially significant reference work. Unfortunately, however, as a "coffee table" publication, the book loses the "average" reader in the tedium of house lists and totem-pole inventories. More importantly, for a reference work, it is underwritten and underreferenced. It is unfortunate, too, that the reference utility of the volume may be hampered by its monumental price. As one who has appreciated and benefitted from MacDonald's expertise in Northwest Coast ethnology, I do not believe *Haida Monumental Art* is an accurate measure of the breadth and excitement of his knowledge.

Margaret B. Blackman
Department of Anthropology
State University of New York
Brockport, New York

First People, First Voices. PENNY PETRONE, ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983. x, 221 p. ISBN 0-8020-2515-3 \$19.95.

First People, First Voices is the only collection of formal speeches, informal commentary, and fiction by Canadian Indians extending from the early European records of the 1630s to the present. Penny Petrone, a professor at Lakehead University's Faculty of Education and participant in its Native Teacher Education Programme, states that her purpose is "to show the beginnings and development in Canada of Indian literary tradition in English" and, incidentally, to document "the Indian view of Canadian history." She suggests that modern Indian writers are, or might in future be, influenced by the written as well as the traditional oral works of their ancestors. Petrone thus evidently hopes that her book will provide reference material and even models for aspiring Indian authors. Inuit and Métis works are by implication excluded, although there is at least one of the latter, an undistinguished text by the nun Sara Riel.

First People, First Voices is a generally well-crafted work that will both interest the general reader and provide useful reference for scholars in Canadian Indian history and literature. The University of Toronto Press has, as usual, produced a handsome book abundantly illustrated with portraits of the authors. One can object

only to the designer's unfortunate choice of quotes — prominently displayed on the jacket — in the “defeated-vanishing-Red-Man” vein; these do not at all represent the rich variety of view-points presented. The texts are organized in loose chronological order and divided into five parts representing five historical periods. The first chapter reprints speeches and commentary by Eastern and Central Canadian Indians, recorded mainly by Catholic missionaries in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, on the subjects of war, trade, religion, and the relative merits of Indian and white cultures. The second chapter covers late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century Indian views on the struggle with spreading European colonization. Overlapping these in the third chapter are texts and sermons by Christian or mission-educated Indians of the nineteenth century. The fourth contains secular Indian texts on social and political topics from the 1850s to the 1950s as well as Indian traditional tales (placed here because they were recorded in the early period of Canadian ethnological field research). In the fifth and final chapter, there is a small selection of current fiction and non-fiction representing modern, pan-Indian, revivalistic themes.

Archivists approaching this book will be interested in how well Petrone chose the documents from the available material, how accurately the texts were translated or transcribed, how fully they were referenced, and how adequately sketched is the historical background. Petrone selected the texts from a very wide variety of available sources including numerous primary document collections, published government documents, documentary histories, newspapers, literary anthologies, and unpublished texts provided by the authors themselves. Unfortunately, the only major field not tapped is modern Indian journalism; much lively and thoughtful prose can be found in current native periodicals. The humorous works of Everett Soop in *Kainai News* and Gilbert Oskaboose in *Indian News* are only two that come to mind. These would have furthered the author's stated intention to stress the literary or creative aspect of Indian writing over its purely descriptive or historical content.

Petrone also concentrates on English-language texts, pleading inability to deal with French material she contends would fill another book. This is perhaps an unfortunate decision since her translated selections from the *Jesuit Relations* and similar early sources stand in awkward discontinuity with the later, English Protestant, Christian texts. Could she not have fleshed out the eastern material with a few Québec texts drawn, for example, from *Recherches Amérindiennes au Québec*? It should also be noted here that the Jesuits were not, as the author claims, the first Europeans to record Indian thoughts. They were predated in Canada by Jacques Cartier and in New England by William Woods and Roger Williams who reported Maritime Indian views somewhat earlier. Nor was 1534, as stated, the date of the Micmac's discovery of the white man; we know from European sources of encounters with Basque, Portuguese, and perhaps other fishermen fifty years earlier.

The editor's selections are revealing and interesting to students of Indian writing with the possible exception of the traditional stories and legends. Although Petrone decided to limit those to a few representative samples since other collections are available, surely she could have found better than the largely pedestrian tales of chapter four. When laid out for general consumption, these texts fail to touch the non-traditional reader. This is either because the English version is uninspired in

literary terms, or because no cultural context is given. "The Grizzly Bears" (p. 161), for example, will be obscure to those with no knowledge of the great tradition of the fall of Tsimshian Temlaham.

Transcribing documents is a more complex task than non-historians usually suppose, and the editor has done it with mixed success. Her own transcriptions directly from primary and secondary sources were (on a random check) exceptionally accurate. Unfortunately she has taken some items from carelessly edited secondary versions; Pierre Tomma's speech (p. 35) from Hamilton and Spray's *Source Materials Relating to the New Brunswick Indians* is riddled with annoying minor textual errors and the English translation of Outreouti's speech (p. 16) from Thatcher's *Indian Biography*, and ultimately from Lahontan's *Voyages* of 1705, obscures significant titles and ethnic designations. Had she referred here (and on pp. 65 and 76) to the more or less accessible originals, or had she pointed out items for which the original source is unknown (for example, pp. 60, 154), she would have increased the reliability of her work. Her decision to "standardize" Indian names (p. viii) is also open to question, though she appears not to have done so extensively.

Petrone's references to the sources of her texts, whether archival or published, are admirably detailed — still all too rare a feature of historical writing on native people. Thus the few incomplete or misplaced references (pp. 32, 73, 127-8, 161, 182-8, 194, 196-98) are more irritants than major defects. The short historical or biographical introductions provided for each individual text and for each of the five chapters are concise and carefully researched. The outer framework of the chapters is marred only by curiously uninformative chapter titles and a certain randomness in the choice of epigraphs.

A vexing question not dealt with in the editor's commentaries is that of interpretation; has the non-Indian hearer or secretary transmitting the Indian's words altered or slanted them for non-Indian consumption? It is conventional to assume that this happened in early missionary reports, but most texts originating before the time Indians gained some control over their own media of expression in English or French are suspect. Petrone refers to the problem only in relation to the early speeches (p. 3). The "literary" trimmings added to a simple Chippewa song by Schoolcraft (p. 50) are evident from the threefold text provided, but what are we to make of the relentless folksiness of Peter Paul's style (p. 54) or the literary allusions of the Williams Lake chief (p. 68)? Both might indeed be genuine, but a few more words from the author would have been useful, especially on how she distinguished what she calls the genuine "Indian voice" from the voices of would-be white interpreters.

This brings us to the question of whether the author does in fact document a distinct "Indian literary tradition." If one is closely critical, the selections in this book demonstrate a continuous native tradition only in the broadest historical sense. It does not appear here as a self-evident tradition in the sense of a shared style (other than in the purely European modes adopted by the interpreters and by recent Indian authors) or in the sense of shared subject matter (other than the reaction to and self-distinction from the invading European culture). For example, one is struck by contrasts as much as by continuities in two near-contemporary works: the Ottawa chief Ocaita's fiercely traditional political speech at Drummond Island in 1818 and Jane Schoolcraft's 1827 poem to her dead son in the high English sentimental style.

The conventional Christian rhetoric of many of the third chapter's texts also seems far from any aboriginal roots. This is not to say that an Indian tradition or perhaps a bundle of merging regional traditions do not exist. But I suspect that it could only be isolated by much closer study of particular Indian styles of oratory and storytelling, or of particular Indian attitudes to nature and society — together with the effect of European influences on these modes of thought — as expressed in a more continuous and complete body of texts.

This book is essentially a reference work and a stepping-off point. Non-academic readers may wish to dip into it rather than read through. Some of the items required to illustrate the more conventional religious and political sentiments are just plain dull. But the book also brings together such fascinating texts as the commentaries on European life by an anonymous Micmac chief (1676), Joseph Brant (1786), and George Henry (1848). The reader will also find Tecumseh's and Ocaita's speeches of reproof to their backsliding British allies in the War of 1812, Maquinna the younger's defence of the potlatch in 1880, James Settee's vivid account of the Ojibway-Sioux battle of 1824, Deskaheh (Levi General's) haunted 1925 broadcast in exile on Six Nations political rights, and Lenore Keeshig-Tobias' elliptical and mysteriously significant poem on the Trickster.

The various criticisms stated here are largely offset by the value of having this material available and placed in its broad historical context. Whether or not the author succeeds in delineating a tradition as such, she has clearly done a most creditable job in bringing together a good variety of classic texts. *First People, First Voices* should show Indian and non-Indian readers alike that the search for a historic Indian view of the Canadian experience is well worth the effort.

Bennett McCardle
Historical Research Services
Ottawa

Mining Photographs and Other Pictures, 1948-1968: A Selection from the Negative Archives of Shedden Studio, Glace Bay, Cape Breton. BENJAMIN H.D. BUCHLOH and ROBERT WILKIE, eds. Halifax: Press of the Nova Scotia College of Art and Design and the University College of Cape Breton Press, 1983. xxviii, 277 p. ISBN 0-9196-1625-9 \$25.00.

In recent years we have become used to the premature release of badly prepared illustrated books on a wide variety of topics. Such books frequently do little more than exploit a recently uncovered collection by simply reproducing it in some garbled form without attention to the integrity of the photographs they display. While they often deserve little more than the local attention they achieve, this book rises above its purely local subject matter to present us with some universal paradigms Canadian scholars all too often ignore. It also demonstrates that the intellectual input necessary for such books is certainly equal to what one might consider acceptable for a traditional monograph.

Leslie Shedden's studio in Glace Bay was like hundreds of others that serviced the photographic needs of small and large communities across Canada. Begun by his father, David Thompson Shedden, early in this century, it was taken over by Leslie