

An unusual case study

A Designated Official Record

by ALAN D. RIDGE AND ELIZABETH M. MCCRUM

*“Oh that my words were now written!
Oh that they were printed in a book.”
Job 19:23*

The Anglican Diocese of Athabasca in northern Alberta was formed in 1874 and, for conducting its affairs, synods were held in 1876 and 1881 at St. David's Mission, Fort Simpson.¹ Manuscript records of the business transacted at these synods, together with copies of resolutions and the constitution of the diocese, survive in the Diocesan Archives deposited in the Provincial Archives of Alberta.² The text of the Bishop's address in 1876 is given on pages 182-187 of an as yet unidentified published historical account of the religious development of the north; loose leaves are in the archives. In 1888 the diocese held at St. Luke's, [Fort] Vermilion the first of its triennial synods. The manuscript archival record comprises the report, constitution of the synod, a *pro forma* for statistics, a record of induction of four ministers, the text of a petition, and a missionary prayer. The report, with the text of the Bishop's address, was printed by the Call Printing Company of Winnipeg. In 1891 the Synod met at St. Peter's, Lesser Slave Lake; a manuscript report is in the archives. This report, with the text of the Bishop's address, was printed by the Rupert's Land Indian Industrial School Press at Middle Church, Manitoba. In 1894 the Synod again met at Lesser Slave Lake but in lieu of a manuscript record, a printed booklet was inserted in the book of manuscript reports.³ The booklet which comprises the report and the Bishop's address, was printed by the Bryant Press of 20 Bay Street, Toronto. The archival significance of this printed record is indicated by the minute noted at the following synod that the minutes *as printed* [our italics] be adopted.

The fourth triennial synod was held in 1900 and the manuscript record comprises the report, lists of members and delegates, notices of motions, the Bishop's address and the collect for the synod.⁴ In addition there are rough drafts⁵ of some motions between Nos. 3 and 25; the wording is not always the same as in the "master" manuscript, but this is hardly surprising. The printed text is remarkable both for the divergences from the main manuscript text and for the amount of annotation. The identity of the

1 A "Synodical Meeting" held for a limited purpose at St. Paul's, Fort Chipewyan in 1883 was not rated as a full synod.

2 Provincial Archives of Alberta, Class A.220

3 Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.220/3

4 Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.220/3

5 Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.220/8d

person responsible for the annotations has not yet been established. Because no other printed texts for earlier synods or for the next two⁶ are so profusely annotated, there seems to be some justification for making a bibliographical examination. Moreover, a special archival significance attaches to the printed copy because at the 1903 synod it was minuted that the minutes *as printed and corrected* [our italics] be adopted. The manuscript record therefore may almost be regarded less as the prime record of the proceedings than as a draft for printing.

The documentary evidence shows that texts for printing were sent from the diocese to Winnipeg but by whom is not known. On 22 September 1900, Bishop Young wrote to the Archbishop of Rupert's Land⁷ that "The Minutes and Report of Proceedings [of Synod] were sent out to my Commissary, Rev. W.A. Burman to be printed. I have not yet received copies." Copies of Bishop Young's letters to Mr. Burman in the next few months make no reference to the Synod Report or its printing, yet as the following extract indicates there must have been an interchange of proofs and comments. On 21 December 1900, Mr. Burman wrote to Bishop Young:⁸

I got your corrected Report as did the printer. The fault cannot justly be placed on him. There are a few printer's errors—but all the bad mistakes were really in the *copy*, which I found very hard to make out. The error as to the amt due C.M.S. was one of these and was printed as written. The \$1115.91. had the first figure either under or over another figure and looked as though it had been purposely obliterated, so that \$115.91. was naturally printed. The written minutes of the Synod were in a confused shape, and had to be re-arranged and even the grammar corrected. That part was *written* and your address I think altogether typewritten. I am very sorry the mistakes occurred but must ask you not to blame the printer. Had I had more time some mistakes might have been deleted by me, but I was just going away and had to hurry through what was at best rather a difficult work.

The *Report of the Fourth Triennial Synod of the Diocese of Athabasca held at Lesser Slave Lake, Athabasca, Friday, June 22nd, 1900, Together with the Bishop's Address* was printed in Winnipeg by the Judd-Moore Printing Company of 219-221 McDermot Avenue. This report consists of 28 pages wrapped in grey papers, measuring $8\frac{19}{32}$ " \times $5\frac{3}{4}$ ", with the title and full nature of its contents printed on the cover. The printed version is organized as follows:

- page [1] is the title page, identical with the cover except that a frame of printers' ornaments is missing

6 The report on the 1903 Synod with the Bishop's Address was printed by William C. Allister of 229 County Road, Liverpool, England. The 1907 report and address were printed by the Monetary Times Printing Company of Toronto. Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.220/9a-c and 10a,b.

7 Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.280/3

8 Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.281/46

- page [3] Lists of clergy, Executive Committee, Commissaries, and Trustees
- page [5] List of members of synod
- pages [7] to 18 contain the text of the Bishop's address and pages [19] to 28 contain the Report of the Synod embracing resolutions and the text of a petition to the Hon. Clifford Sifton, Minister of the Interior. Pagination starts at page 8, runs through to page 18 and begins again at page 20 continuing to page 28.

The major difference in composition between the manuscript and the printed text is that in the original the Bishop's address comes after the report, whereas it precedes it in the booklet. The printed text also omits the collect for the synod which is given in the manuscript.

Extant copies of the printed booklet are located in the Provincial Archives of Alberta (three copies, of which two are annotated)⁹ in the Archives of the Anglican Church of Canada at 600 Jarvis Street, Toronto (2 copies), in the British Library, London,¹⁰ and in Lambeth Palace Library, London. Apart from the two copies in Toronto, all purport to have been corrected in manuscript and the evidence is that the corrections were made in one hand, though sometimes written and sometimes block printed. Red ink was always used. In view of the archival nature of the printed and "corrected" report it is astonishing to find variations between the annotations in the printed texts; of particular note are the dissimilarities on page 9.

The accompanying table indicates the discrepancies between the printed text and the manuscript text, as well as divergences between the annotations. It will be noted that at times the annotations repair the text in favour of the original and there are gratuitous interpolations of data (by whose authority is not specified). Moreover there are inconsistencies in the use of initials for people's names or corporate bodies' titles both in the manuscript and in the printed texts.

In sum then, we have a manuscript record which is not the designated official record, and we have printed copies of a hand-annotated text which frequently deviates from the original manuscript, and which is not specifically authenticated. The poor result stemmed from bad drafting, remote control shared between Athabasca Landing and Winnipeg, and a printer who was not familiar with the requirements. There is nothing wrong or reprehensible in designating as an official archive a publication which has been printed or otherwise reproduced, provided that the copy's uniqueness is guaranteed and properly authenticated. It would be well for custodians to be alert to this kind of problem which may arise when they

9 Provincial Archives of Alberta, A.220/8a-c

10 British Library, 4745.K.32

seek to identify the master set or archival series of an organization's minutes, agenda, periodic reports, accounts and circulars which may have been issued in multiple copies. *Caveat custos!*

TABLE TO INDICATE COMPARISONS BETWEEN THE MANUSCRIPT AND PRINTED TEXTS

BL - Copy in the British Library

LP - Copy in the Lambeth Palace Library

T - Copies in the Anglican Church of Canada Archives, Toronto

DIOCESAN COPIES — PRINTED	MANUSCRIPT TEXT	PRINTED VARIATIONS
Cover of report " <i>Corrected Copy</i> . See especially <i>Page 15.</i> ": in red ink. "Bishop Young": in black ink. Handwritten. (no ink ref. to Bishop Young on copy 2).		No annotation. T. BL and LP resemble Copy 2.
Page [3] Lists of clergy & officials l.23. "1" in Ashlington Rectory deleted (On copy 2 l.9 "Christ Church, Smoky River" deleted and "St. John's Peace River" inserted in black ink.)	List of clergy given but not of the Executive Committee, Commissaries or Trustees. Ashington	No annotation. T.
Page [5] Rubber stamp deletes motions with words "see page 20."		
Page [7] Copy 2 lists the ten pages with red ink annotations		No listing. BL, LP, T.
Page [7] l.6 a triennial synod l.8 mutual council l.14 "Word" deleted: "work" inserted	a 3 yearly Synod mutual counsel "k" superimposed on "d" at end of word	No annotation. T.
ll.19 and 23. Mrs. E.J. Lawrence	Mrs. E.J. Lawrence [incorrect]	
l.23 memory fresh amongst us l.25 the "Irene" School l.27 are now, I expect, on their way	memory fresh among us the Irene School are I expect now on their way	
Page 8 l.1 labourers and I am sure we ll.7-9 assistance readily and generously granted, we must not forget to thank the Committee of Canadian Church Missionary Association of Canada	labourers. I am sure we assistance both readily and generously granted we must not forget to thank the Com. of Can. Ch. Missy. Association of Canada	"to thank" deleted: "the" inserted before "Canadian". BL.
ll.15-16 Rev. A.S. White is now in charge of St. Luke's Mission	Rev. A.S. White was ordained deacon by the Bishop of Qu'Appelle Sept. 1899 and is now in charge of St. Luke's Mission	
l.17 of the Rev. M. Scott l.18 but also to us all. We lose l.22 school teacher l.24 work in 1899 l.27 January of 1899	of Rev. M. Scott also a loss to us all. We loose schoolmaster work in 1898 January 1899	

DIOCESAN COPIES — PRINTED	MANUSCRIPT TEXT	PRINTED VARIATIONS
<p><i>l.28</i> recognize <i>l.29</i> to the Athabasca Landing <i>l.33</i> a point when</p>	<p>recognise to the Landing a point where</p>	<p>“the” deleted. BL.</p>
<p>Page 9</p>		
<p><i>l.6</i> Miss Durntall <i>l.9</i> Durling <i>l.10</i> Mr. Richard Cox <i>ll.11-12</i> who before coming to us was a teacher in the Reserve School</p>	<p>Miss Durntall During Mr. R. Cox and before coming to us was a teacher in one of the Reserve Schools</p>	<p>“one of” inserted before “the”: “School” amended to “Schools”. BL.</p>
<p><i>l.17</i> the Woman’s Auxiliary <i>l.23</i> the Indian Boarding School at Wapuscaw. (Copy 2 has the same addition as the B.L. text)</p>	<p>the W. Aux. the Indian Boarding School at Wapuscaw.</p>	<p>after “Wapuscaw” is added, “and Miss White who has come out from England to help her brother in his work at Vermilion.” BL.</p>
<p><i>l.24</i> the Diocese <i>l.25</i> gauged <i>ll.29-30</i> “to be exercised” deleted; “can be effectually maintained” inserted after “Diocese”. The revised text reads “from which a supervision of the Diocese can be effectually maintained and so as to be”</p>	<p>the diocese gauged from which to exercise a supervision of the Diocese and so as to be</p>	<p>No annotation. T.</p>
<p>Page 10</p>		
<p><i>l.5</i> of Rev. Henry Robinson <i>l.7</i> We have added <i>ll.7-8</i> since we last met—that at Wapuscaw—Under <i>l.12</i> Commissioner Laird of a grant towards teacher’s salary <i>l.14</i> question of school <i>ll.19-20</i> the number of adults and also young persons <i>l.20</i> cause of thankfulness <i>ll.26-28</i> and when the first unsettlement has subsided, it certainly, should be beneficial as a pledge that provision will be made <i>l.29</i> infrequently</p>	<p>of Rev. H. Robinson We have also added since we met last — at Wapuscaw. Under Governor Laird of a grant towards Teacher’s Salary question of Schools the number both of adults and young persons cause for thankfulness and that when the first unsettlement has subsided it will be beneficial. certainly a pledge that provision shall be made unfrequently</p>	
<p>Page 11</p>		
<p><i>ll.6-7</i> in the Memorandum a representation from us as a Synod to Ottawa [period omitted] <i>l.9</i> and to do what we can <i>l.20</i> the Rev. A.E. Cowley <i>l.20</i> amounts <i>l.21</i> at which bank; I trust this <i>l.27</i> position towards any of you <i>l.29</i> me giving you half yearly statements as I used to in</p>	<p>in the Memorandum, as a representation from us as a Synod to Ottawa. and do what we can Rev. A.E. Cowley. amount at which Bank, and trust this position towards any one of you my giving you Half yearly statements as I used to do in</p>	

DIOCESAN COPIES — PRINTED	MANUSCRIPT TEXT	PRINTED VARIATIONS
Page 12		
l.3 balance will be for or against	balance may be for or against	
l.6 credit balances are brought	credit balance are brought	
l.10 case of any mistakes	case of any mistake	
l.19 regulations	regulation	
ll.20-21 Diocese of Rupert's Land	the Rupert's Land Diocese	
l.23 of his Mission	in his Mission	
l.30 "This is" deleted in part: "ese are" inserted: text now reads "These are on the increase"	This in on the increase	No annotation. T.
ll.33-34 as well as the Missionaries	as well as the Missionary	
Page 13		
l.1 Some of the brethren	Some of our brethren	
l.3 "these" inserted at end of line after "either"	either these	No annotation. T.
l.7 donor	donors	
ll.12-13 .If funds are remitted as in the past to his Commissary, outsiders would be satisfied to know	.Outsiders would (if they are remitted in the past instance to his Commissary) be satis- fied to know	
l.18 been possible hitherto	hitherto been possible	
l.25 proceedure	proceedure	
ll.28-29 "d" at end of "charged" deleted; text now reads "Missionary in charge"	Missionary-in-charge	No annotation. BL,LP,T.
ll.29-30 danger of losing the cheque occurs.	danger of loosing the cheque is incurred	
l.30 sent to me at the Landing	sent to me to the Landing	
Page 14		
l.7 entered on the filed copy	entered on the copy	
l.17 no actual losses	no actual loss	
l.27 Mr. Mathewson	Mr. Matthewson	
ll.28-29 who has had to retire	who had to retire	
l.30 lose	loose	
Page 15		
ll.1-2 toward	towards	
l.4 "it" deleted: text now reads "This to be paid"	This to be paid	No annotation. BL,T.
l.5 "s" deleted at end of "amounts": text now reads "amount . . . is"	amounts . . . is	No annotation. BL,T.
l.9 averageing	averaging	
l.11 demands: final "s" is typographically misplaced		
l.14 showed	shewed	
l.16 "\$100" underlined: "\$1000" written in margin	\$1000	No annotation. T.
l.18 "\$115:91" underlined: \$1115.91" written in margin	\$1115.91	No annotation. T.
l.24 Missions where in existence	Missions were in existence	
ll.28-29 Domestic and Foreign Missions. A form for	Domestic and Foreign Mis- sions — (See Report on In- dian Missions pp. 18 and 15). A form for	

DIOCESAN COPIES — PRINTED	MANUSCRIPT TEXT	PRINTED VARIATIONS
<p>Page 16</p> <p><i>l.</i> 3 charged children</p> <p><i>l.</i> 8 is representation</p> <p><i>l.</i> 15 Superanuotion</p> <p><i>l.</i> 16 vide Provincial Synod Report, Appendix F.</p> <p><i>l.</i> 21 subscriptions</p> <p><i>l.</i> 22 after subscribing</p> <p><i>l.</i> 26 a canon, passed</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 27-28 with regard to the Clergy Superannuation Fund</p>	<p>charged for children</p> <p>is our representation</p> <p>Superannuation</p> <p>P.S.R. app. F.</p> <p>subscription</p> <p>after subscription</p> <p>Canon past</p> <p>— Clergy Superannuation Fund —</p>	
<p>Page 17</p> <p><i>l.</i> 1 printed in syllabics</p> <p><i>l.</i> 4 “Wood” Cree</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 8-9 Bryan Publishing Co.</p> <p><i>l.</i> 11 a hand press, and all necessary outfit</p> <p><i>l.</i> 13 In the meanwhile</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 16-17 a book of instructions, prayers and hymns. Also the Creed</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 18-19 “a” inserted at end of line: text now reads “This has gone into a second edition.”</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 22-23 a second edition of the whole Bible</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 29-30 Old and New Testament</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 33-34 Six years of change, trial, discouragements, as well as thank God encouragement have passed away.</p>	<p>in plain Syllabics</p> <p>Wood Cree</p> <p>Bryant Publishing Co.</p> <p>a Hand Press — the type and all necessary outfit.</p> <p>In the meantime</p> <p>a Book of Instruction, Prayers and Hymns also the Creed</p> <p>This has gone into a second edition</p> <p>a revised edition of the whole Bible</p> <p>Old and New Testaments</p> <p>Six years of changes, trials, discouragements, as well as, thank God, encouragements have passed away.</p>	No annotation. T.
<p>Page 18</p> <p><i>l.</i> 4 realize</p> <p><i>l.</i> 4 “h” inserted in “spere” to read “sphere”</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 5-6 He will not leave or forsake us</p> <p><i>l.</i> 10 constant prayer be</p>	<p>realise</p> <p>sphere</p> <p>He will not leave nor forsake us</p> <p>constant Prayer for them be</p>	No annotation. T.
<p>Page [19]</p> <p><i>l.</i> 8 by Rev. Hy. Robinson</p> <p><i>ll.</i> 13-14 During the service the Bishop delivered part of his address dealing with other than financial matters.</p> <p><i>l.</i> 16 by the Rev. M. Scott</p> <p><i>l.</i> 18 Albert Tate</p> <p><i>l.</i> 20 by Rev. M. Scott</p>	<p>by the Revd. H. Robinson</p> <p>[Not given]</p> <p>by Revd. M. Scott</p> <p>Albert Tait</p> <p>by the Revd. M. Scott</p>	
<p>Page 20</p> <p>[Notices of motion: these omit ten notices of motions of thanks to corporate bodies & societies]</p> <p><i>l.</i> 11 adjourned</p> <p><i>l.</i> 12 On again meeting</p> <p><i>l.</i> 13 referred to financial matters, and referred</p>	<p>[Lists 13 notices of motions which were later minuted in detail with six other resolutions of which advance notice was not given].</p> <p>ajourned</p> <p>On meeting again</p> <p>referred to the financial matters, and refered</p>	

DIOCESAN COPIES — PRINTED	MANUSCRIPT TEXT	PRINTED VARIATIONS
<p><i>ll.</i> 20-21 but before the appointment <i>l.</i> 25 final ‘‘l’’ of ‘‘fill’’ deleted and ‘‘ful’’ inserted at beginning: text now reads ‘‘to fulfil his duties’’ <i>l.</i> 27 [omission of Motion number ‘‘3’’ before the words ‘‘that this Synod’’]</p>	<p>but before appointment to fill his duties</p> <p>3. [in margin] that this Synod</p>	No annotation. T.
<p>Page 21 <i>l.</i> 6 compliance of request</p> <p><i>l.</i> 11 past <i>l.</i> 31 good grounds</p>	<p>Compliance of request</p> <p>part good ground</p>	‘‘the’’ inserted before ‘‘request’’. BL.
<p>Page 22 <i>l.</i> 16 ‘‘such’’ inserted above ‘‘as’’ at end of line: text now reads ‘‘such as’’ <i>ll.</i> 18-19 rank and file can stand</p> <p><i>l.</i> 19 inducement <i>l.</i> 20 to be silent <i>l.</i> 26 [omission of date and names of signatories]</p> <p><i>l.</i> 27 Synod here adjourned <i>l.</i> 28 On meeting again it</p>	<p>such as</p> <p>rank and file of the Force can stand inducements to keep silent June 22nd, 1900 [eleven signatories as per list on page [5]] Synod then adjourned On meeting again after Tea It</p>	No annotation. BL, T.
<p>Page 23 <i>l.</i> 7 lose <i>l.</i> 8 our labourers <i>ll.</i> 11-12 Mr. W. Whitford <i>ll.</i> 12-13 printed and also the proceedings <i>ll.</i> 16-17 Col. and Cont. Church Society.</p> <p><i>l.</i> 20 further help from it.</p> <p><i>l.</i> 22 :That the members <i>l.</i> 24 acceded <i>l.</i> 31 all its kindness</p>	<p>loose the labourers Mr. Wm. Whitford printed, also the proceedings Colonial and Continental Church Society further help from it for providing the Ministry of God’s Word to the Settlers — The members accorded all their Kindness</p>	
<p>Page 24 <i>l.</i> 7 ‘‘their’’ deleted and ‘‘our’’ inserted: text now reads ‘‘express our sincere thanks’’ <i>ll.</i> 8-9 Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge <i>l.</i> 11 as a most <i>l.</i> 25 strength and opportunity <i>l.</i> 26 ‘‘this’’ amended to ‘‘the’’: text now reads ‘‘of the Society’’</p>	<p>express their sincere thanks</p> <p>S.P.C.K.</p> <p>as most strength and opportunities of this Society</p>	No annotation. LP, T.
<p>Page 25 <i>l.</i> 2 :That the members <i>l.</i> 7 to assist those through our Mission generally <i>l.</i> 8 towards <i>l.</i> 15 desires to thank <i>l.</i> 17 by their line</p>	<p>— The members to assist those in want through our Missions generally toward desire sincerely to thank by their lines</p>	No annotation. LP, T.

DIOCESAN COPIES — PRINTED	MANUSCRIPT TEXT	PRINTED VARIATIONS
l.21 The Synod desire	The Synod of this Diocese desires	
l.26 unable	not able	
Page 26		
l.8 British & Foreign Bible Society	Brit. and Foreign Bible Society	
ll.15-16 British & Foreign Bible Society	Brit. and For. Bible Society	
l.29 "recognzie" amended to "recognise"	recognise	No annotation. T.
l.33 "be" deleted: text now reads "it should, consistent with durability"	it should consistent with durability	No annotation. T.
Page 27		
l.1 comma inserted: text now reads "and clearness of type, be as"	and clearness of type be as	No annotation. BL, T.
l.9 translations	translation	
l.15 "their" amended to "there": text now reads "is there either a probability or advisability"	is there either the probability or advisability	No annotation. T.
l.18 seems to be	seem to be	
l.19 "be" inserted: text now reads "to read and be appreciated"	to be read and appreciated	No annotation. T.
l.19 [names of 4 signatories omitted]	(Signed) M. Scott, G. Holmes, D. Curry, C.D. White, H.B. Co.	
l.27 Hudson's Bay Co.	time to time in many ways for the consideration shown to them in many ways	
ll.29-30 time to time, for the consideration shewn to them in many ways	time to time in many ways for the consideration shown to them in many ways	
l.33 preparing	providing	
Page 28		
ll.2,6,11 Rev. G. Holmes	Rev. Geo. Holmes for the ensuing General and Provincial Synods	
l.8 for the general and Provincial Synod	R.D. Richardson Esq. Thomas Gill esq.	
ll.9-10 R.D. Richardson Esq. and Thomas Gill Esq.	he has discharged	
l.14 he discharged	The Bishop then declared the Acts of the Synods and closed the Session with the <i>Benediction</i>	
ll.16-17 The Bishop then declared the Acts of the Synod and closed the Session by pronouncing the Benediction		
Pages 27-28		
extra leaf inserted: no handwritten annotations (Copy 2 has no extra leaf)		No extra leaves. BL,LP,T.