

teaching purposes. Donald Watt's entertaining article shatters Grenville's call to action with "inevitably there is an element of home movie about the final product. . . . The historian as producer is no more satisfactory than the producer as amateur historian." He is, however, an advocate of the Open University's team approach to the making of films. Jerry Kuehl unashamedly presents the professional producer's view. He is as harsh as Watt in his criticism of the Consortium's work, and is quick to point out that the medium itself has severe limitations which are not the fault of current practitioners. His discussion, although clearly from the perspective of mass television, also gives us, in the last sentence of the book, one of its most interesting suggestions: that the efforts of historians "would be more valuable if directed to making filmed records of persons or events which would otherwise go unrecorded. . . ."

The book's index seems complete and the bibliography, prepared by the Slade Film History Register, is excellent. *The Historian and Film* is, in short, a most useful tool, and quite suitable as a text book, even if only for the articles by Hughes and Pronay. The last third would be rewarding reading for any academic thinking of dabbling in film or television. The general reader in the fields of archives, history, or film will find a great deal that is superficial, but enough food for thought to make the investment worthwhile.

K.M. Larose
National Film Archives
Public Archives of Canada

Vancouver's First Century: A City Album, 1860-1960. Edited by ANNE KLOPPENBORG [et al.] Introduction by DAVID BROCK. North Vancouver: J.J. Douglas, 1977. 154 p. ill. ISBN 0 88894 146 3 \$19.95.

Winnipeg: An Illustrated History. ALAN ARTIBISE. Toronto: James Lorimer; [Ottawa]: National Museum of Man, 1977. 224 p. ill., maps, ports. (The History of Canadian cities) ISBN 0 88862 150 7 bd. \$12.95; ISBN 0 88862 151 5 pa. \$8.95.

Vancouver's First Century and *Winnipeg: An Illustrated History* are two quite different works of urban history, yet each is basically successful in its own way. The first book is a "city album" that has exaggerated Vancouver's municipal existence by a few years, while the second, despite the allusion in the title to illustrations, is essentially a scholarly text supplemented by photographs, maps, and cartoons. The photographs in *Vancouver's First Century* are an organic part of the book, whereas those in *Winnipeg* are mere vestiges. These books are good examples for archives of the two methodological extremes which employ photographs.

Vancouver's First Century is a personal vision of the city's past, with contents collected and partly synthesized by the editors of *Urban Reader*, a magazine produced by the city's Social Planning Department. The editors have demonstrated a firm grasp of current social issues in Vancouver, but their interpretation of Vancouver's history through the use of quotations from newspapers, journals, diaries and the like leaves much to be desired.

The volume, superficially magnificent in its presentation of almost two hundred duotone photographs and enough white space to reduce crowding of text and images, had its genesis in five special issues of *Urban Reader* that appeared in 1974 and 1975. The book, however, is divided into eight chapters with a noticeable thinning of dramatic and exciting images after 1914. The photographs from 1914 to 1960 might

best be described overall as mediocre, except for a few outstanding classics. No effort was made by the editors to link photographs with text, leaving readers to conjecture what these images contribute toward an understanding of the city's past.

The photographs depicting the years between 1860 and 1914 are of similar uneven thematic quality. For those familiar with standard histories of Vancouver, the selection of images is disappointingly unimaginative, since most are no more than stock illustrations. The fact that they have been rendered for the first time in duotone does not alter their status as hackneyed images. Vancouver has a particularly rich photographic heritage, yet this ample resource has not been fully exploited by the editors.

The quality of research into the origins of these early images does not match the excellent reproduction of the prints in either *Winnipeg* or *Vancouver's First Century*, but at least the latter provides some information on photographers, a detail entirely ignored in the former. In addition, no substantial contextual reference is made to the photographs or photographers in *Winnipeg*, where the reader is referred to the fourteen maps, but never to the one hundred photographs. The many intriguing images are left to speak for themselves, posing such questions as: Who was this comic assembly of men known as the Elk's Jazz Band and why are they wearing those beanies? What is the significance of the 1926 group portrait of the Fuller Brush Company's Field Manager School? Who is Mrs. A.C. Ross and did she ever marry off her eight daughters?

Artibise gives no credit to the Winnipeg photographers and caption information is usually minimal. A list of photographs as part of the table of contents would have been helpful, or, better still, access to the images through the index. Almost half the photographs in *Winnipeg* are the work of L.B. Foote, yet he is not mentioned once in the text. As the first of a new series called *The History of Canadian Cities*, it would be a shame if this work were the model for future volumes insofar as the presentation of photographs is concerned.

The editors of *Vancouver's First Century* have also failed to provide information on the photographers and photographs which they have chosen to help interpret and corroborate their historical pastiche. Newspaper advertisements are used, but there is a noticeable absence of notices for a photographer or studio. Newspaper items are liberally quoted, yet not one refers to a photographer. Extracts from Major J.S. Matthews' seven-volume oral history, *Early Vancouver*, form a large part of the text, but none of these mentions photographers (possibly more the fault of Matthews than the editors). The caption information for the pre-1914 images is extraordinarily inaccurate. Photographers are not credited for work known to be theirs by the institution which supplied the negative, incorrect dates are given and, in several cases, an image known to be the work of one photographer is attributed to another. Such misrepresentations lead the reader to draw many incorrect conclusions. In the preface, for example, the editors erroneously imply that William Notman (that is, William Notman, Jr.) of William Notman & Son, Montreal, lived in Vancouver. The choice of his more familiar images of Vancouver and environs over those taken by a resident photographer is questionable, particularly since Vancouver photographers such as Robert H. Trueman & Norman Caple, Charles S. Bailey & George H. Neelands (later, the Bailey Brothers), and Stephen J. Thompson were producing images equal or even superior to those by Notman, Jr.

The scrapbook approach of *Vancouver's First Century* has been commercially successful, but the editors have not advanced the state of Vancouver's history, if that was their intention. They have, nevertheless, publicized the fine visual heritage of the city, which is alone a good thing if the factual errors can be ignored. *Winnipeg: An Illus-*

trated History and its companion volumes are sure to become standard works in the field of urban history. Artibise, in spite of an academic approach and a technically well-produced volume, has failed to account for both the photographers and their unique role in recording for posterity the patterns of urban growth in images that speak at times more eloquently and sometimes more truthfully than all the footnotes in the world.

David Mattison
Columbia College, Vancouver

Sailing Ships of the Maritimes: An Illustrated History of Shipping and Shipbuilding in the Maritime Provinces of Canada, 1750-1925. CHARLES A. ARMOUR & THOMAS LACKEY. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, ©1975. 224 p. illus. (some col.) ISBN 0 07 077756 X \$19.95.

In a dust-jacket "blurb" to be commended for its accuracy and restraint we are informed that "in the peak years of the 1860s, the Maritimes supplied nearly one quarter of British shipping" and that by the end of the century more than twenty-six hundred sailing vessels had been built on these shores. Yet the sources for studying this important activity are by no means complete. In his introduction, Charles Armour warns us of large gaps in the early series of shipping registers and, in particular, the difficulty of identifying builders in those which remain. Who would have thought at the time that such records, destroyed wholesale around our coasts, would be of such value long after the timbers, shrouds, lines and sails of the ships they describe have decayed? There is a mute warning here for the archivist struggling with appraisal and trying to second-guess future needs.

This is a well-conceived publication, superior in many ways to the usual glossy picture books under which the coffee tables of the nation are presently groaning. The work is much more than a well-illustrated, popular account; under such heads as "Prizes and Privateers," "Trade and Timber, 1820-1845" and "The Golden Age, 1846-1867," Dr. Armour provides us with a very decent survey of developments in Maritime shipping over two hundred years. Not only the vessels themselves, but also the captains, the crews, the passengers, the cabin interiors, the rigs and the shipwrights' tools are all discussed. There is enough here on the technology of sail to explain the success and decline of a great craft industry which almost survived the entire span of the industrial age, a constant reminder that mass production and steam power were not always synonymous with economy.

To complement his text Armour draws on the pictorial expertise of his co-author, Thomas Lackey, who uses some documents, classic marinescapes, simple lithographs, Bartlett engravings and, above all, those splendid "portraits" of vessels which sail dimly through galleries and museums with a full spread of canvas, but sparse explanation. The term "illustrates" is inappropriate because the authors offer a study in the use of visual material to describe, with a text to explain. In short, they treat us to a series of perceptive studies in marine interpretation which will be of considerable assistance to archivists faced with problems of identification; they have caused this reviewer to be very careful in future how he describes a "ship" as opposed to a brig or a barque.

It is particularly interesting to see how the camera, so relentlessly explicit, illumines small vignettes: wife and baby in the captain's cabin, the sailmaker at work, the shipyards with deals scattered broadcast and a deceptive air of confusion which is the