

At times the book falls short on analysis. Hill takes a frank look at H.H. Stevens and his relationship with the department, offering both negative and positive impressions, but she does not analyze the work of other ministers as thoroughly, leaving the impression that the work of the others was of a more even quality. At the end of Sir George Foster's term of office, we are given only his own positive recollections of the value of his work, with which the author largely concurs, and observations by others such as J.W. Dafoe that Foster had not been a good administrator. Yet his achievements as an innovator were considerable and of lasting effect on the department. The author might have commented here, whether from the department's perspective or not, and attempted to reconcile what appear to be contradictory viewpoints.

Such criticisms are not major, and do not diminish the book's strengths. The impressive detail on shifting functions and responsibilities, both within the department and between Trade and Commerce and other federal agencies, is an invaluable aid to researcher and archivist alike. It is a thorough description of the work of a department that played no small part in Canada's economic development in the twentieth century. In the introduction, Hill indicates further directions for study, such as the department's relations with provincial governments and the business community in Canada, and the effects technological advances in communications have had on its work. Such studies would be welcomed, especially were the authors to attain the standards set in Hill's work.

Eldon Frost,  
Public Records Division,  
Public Archives of Canada.

**The History of Canadian Business, 1867-1914.** R.T. NAYLOR. Toronto: J. Lorimer, 1975. 2 v. ISBN 0 88862 094 2, ISBN 0 88862 095 0 bd. \$13.00; ISBN 0 88862 092 6, ISBN 0 88862 093 4 pa. \$6.95.

The appearance in 1975 of *The History of Canadian Business, 1867-1914* by Tom Naylor prompted both surprise and eager anticipation. Many believed the lack of completed groundwork in this relatively neglected field would prohibit production of a scholarly complete history. At the same time a work which promised a provocative new approach was welcomed as a departure from the usual formats of whiggish narrative and biography. In the preface much was promised. Besides seizing the cudgel brandished by Gustavus Myers sixty years ago, Naylor undertook to examine the political economy of development, a colonial economy in transition, the causes, distribution and effects of foreign investment in such an economy, and to present a general commercial, financial and industrial history. If that were not enough, he also promised to shed light upon the origins of our current economic structures. With such wide-ranging objectives, opportunities for comment, criticism and debate are inevitably present.

The subject is divided in two: one volume deals with banking and finance, the other with industrial development. Within this structure the author discourses on government tariff, patent and bonusing policies, railways, industrial growth and investment, Canadian entrepreneurship abroad, and banking practices and their impact upon business. The conclusions which Naylor reaches are not flattering. He finds that our economy suffered from an acute case of colonialism in which a commercial elite and their political henchmen moulded financial and other policies to ensure a steady flow of British investment capital. Because of the dominance of the commercial capitalists, industrial entrepreneurship was neglected, with the result that we came to rely upon

American industrial knowledge and business acumen. Canada was thus locked into a double colonial dependency, and the economy never fully made the transition from commercialism to industrialism. This dependent condition was highly addictive, so much so that we never kicked the habit. No wonder Eric Kierans penned the forward to volume one!

Material for the work was drawn from an impressive array of scholarly articles, monographs, newspapers and government publications. The text suggests that not all of these sources have been utilized, and footnotes reveal a high reliance upon newspapers, particularly the *Monetary Times*. Since the press is often highly subjective, both in content and tone, the problem of interpretation arises. Critical analysis by the author was required to ensure that journalistic bias did not colour his work, but on occasion it seems that this scrutiny was not undertaken. Use of primary sources would have aided in the verification process, at the same time enriching Naylor's view and adding weight to his conclusions. The considerable selection of excellent archival collections relevant to these volumes has, lamentably, been neglected.

The book is highly critical of the banking and commercial elite and their political collaborators. One expects to see Naylor tear into his subject with a Marxist bulldozer, but while he deviates from that approach enough to incur the displeasure of the more orthodox, he does not go far enough to make the less doctrinaire feel at ease. His wanton sniping at the economic establishment at times appears awkward and silly, and a propensity for overstatement leads occasionally to such absurdities as the claim that Confederation was little more than an exercise in public finance.

Other weaknesses require comment. The author seems to approach his study with a preconception requiring substantiation, but unfortunately he often jumps to conclusions which are neither preceded by thorough analysis of his material nor justified by its content. There is also a problem of balance. Some aspects are covered too intensively while others, including management techniques, the role of technology and even the *dramatis personae*, receive scant attention. In reality, Naylor has produced a study of the functioning of a segment of Canada's post-Confederation economy rather than a complete history of business. Finally, closer editing would have reduced the number of typographical errors and may even have avoided the embarrassment of a thirty-line paragraph appearing in the second volume on pages 193-94 and again on page 280.

Although one can pick away at the salient faults of *The History of Canadian Business*, one cannot criticize Tom Naylor's bravery. He launches an assault on some of our most entrenched historical assumptions and interpretations. He may not have been completely successful in his attempt, but he has presented much useful new evidence and has kindled a controversy which should continue to burn for some time.

Peter E. Rider  
Public Archives of Canada

**The Fur Trade in Minnesota: An Introductory Guide to Manuscript Sources.**

Compiled by BRUCE M. WHITE. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 1977. 61 p. ill. map. (Publications of the Minnesota Historical Society) ISBN 0 87351 121 2 \$4.50.

For 129 years the Minnesota Historical Society has had a penetrating interest in the fur trade, an interest confirmed with the publication of an introductory guide to its fur trade holdings. There are 104 alphabetical entries, dating from 1780 to 1840, but only about one-quarter of these belong to the Society; the remainder are copies from other