

The second part of the *Guide* covers the collections of individuals and some organizations, again in the same format. Most of the individual collections are the personal papers of Smithsonian administrators and curators. Their papers often complement what is available in the official record. Most of the collections document the work of naturalists who were busy recording the flora and fauna of the Americas during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The records of organizations which have donated their papers to the Smithsonian also relate mainly to the natural sciences. There are a few collections that deal with other subjects such as the pure sciences, technology, American history, or culture. The appendices at the end of the book list the record units (collections) by media, by discipline (very useful), by a chronological bar graph (less useful), and by an index to names and organizations.

At first glance, there may seem to be nothing of relevance to Canadian readers in the *Guide*. A close reading reveals, however, that the field notes and drawings of Leslie Gale Saunders, a University of Saskatchewan professor who studied *Diptera* (two-winged flies), are in the Smithsonian. The Smithsonian sent Robert Kennicott to collect natural history specimens in the Mackenzie River area in 1859. He came into contact with Roderick Ross MacFarlane and Bernard Rogan Ross (both Hudson's Bay Company employees) and inspired them to collect specimens too. Though very small, their papers now form part of the Smithsonian's holdings. The institution had a particular interest in the Canadian North as well as Alaska. Researchers interested in the Canadian North would do well to check what is available in Washington.

Researchers should be aware that the *Guide* covers only a portion of the Smithsonian's archival holdings. The collections and manuscripts gathered by Smithsonian curators are to be found in the National Anthropological Archives, the Archives of American Art, and the National Museum of American History. The Archives Center of the latter, formed in 1983, already has 142 collections. The remaining collections are still in the hands of its individual curators.

The *Guide to the Smithsonian Archives* is a very valuable research tool. Very few archival institutions, even the very large ones, produce guides to their collections. Canadian archives could do more to follow the Smithsonian example. It is not necessary for every archives to publish a guide the size of a book. The effort put into such a guide would save researchers and even the institution itself considerable time and energy by providing adequate information about collections. Researchers are often forced to depend on the miniaturized descriptions of collections that are found in the *Union List of Manuscripts*. A guide such as the Smithsonian's fills the gap by providing a fuller description of individual collections and an overview of an institution's holdings.

Larry McNally
Manuscript Division
Public Archives of Canada

Justice in Early Ontario, 1791-1840: A Study of Crime, Courts and Prisons in Upper Canada. CHARLES K. TALBOT. Ottawa: Crimcare, 1983. xviii, 450 p. ISBN 0-919395-02-3 \$45.00.

This volume should be of interest to archivists not for what it is but for what it could have been. Every archives contains collections which have immense research value but whose

volume intimidates researchers. Too often finding aids for such collections are either brief and uninformative or are almost as time consuming to wade through as the collection itself, and they do little to aid the researcher in answering the question of whether or not the documents will be of value for their particular research problem. At the Public Archives of Canada the correspondence of the Civil and Provincial Secretaries (RG5 A1) contains over 142,000 pages. Contained on ninety reels of microfilm, the collection is a miscellany of correspondence, petitions, and reports on all aspects of the administration of Upper Canada from 1791 to 1840. The finding aid for this material (number 881) is a calendar of the correspondence which in itself occupies almost one metre of shelf space or four reels of microfilm. Preparation of the calendar began sometime before 1953 as a listing of the endorsements on the correspondence jackets and was not completed until the early 1970s. There is no subject access to the collection and the diversity of documentation comes as a surprise to anyone encountering the series for the first time.

Given the volume and the richness of the material in the Upper Canada Sundries, the purpose of part of Charles Talbot's volume makes some sense. He has reviewed the finding aid for the series and has selected material relating to crime, courts, and prisons. The resulting edited finding aid has potential value, as would the result of a similar project using such topics as education, transportation, or perhaps a geographical area. Talbot has re-arranged the legal material to give chronological lists of papers relating to the judicial system, crimes, and prisons in Upper Canada. Had this effort, with a short introduction to explain the arrangement and context of the records, been the end of Talbot's work this would have been a much better and less expensive book.

Unfortunately, the edited finding aid appears almost as an afterthought. Talbot states that he has tried to produce "a preliminary exploratory document that could serve as a source text for future study." He has done so by ransacking a seemingly endless list of secondary sources for mentions of crime and in so doing has produced one of the few useful things in the book — a lengthy bibliography. The result is a repetition of the type of anecdotal and antiquarian history which was fashionable in the late nineteenth century. Talbot trots out Dickens and Shakespeare and even James Joyce and W.S. Gilbert wherever possible (and a few places where one would have thought it was not possible). A list of barristers in the colony prompts "the first thing we do, lets kill all the lawyers." A section on theft and robbery is preceded by a description of a member of Fagan's gang from *Oliver Twist*. He relies for "atmosphere" on several authors who had nothing to do with Canada and little to do with the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Susan Willis Fletcher's 1884 volume *Twelve Months in an English Prison* may have something in common with Jack Henry Abbott's *In the Belly of the Beast: Letters from Prison* but it is not clear what either has to do with Upper Canada. This apparently purposeless use of quotations reaches its nadir in a section of the volume on the Wellington District Jail at Guelph where quotations of some thirteen lines from an 1853 English opus on crime and four lines from *The Belly of the Beast* introduce a text with a total length of only six lines.

There are footnotes aplenty but they only confirm the suspicion that Talbot has looked no farther into the Upper Canada Sundries than the finding aid and apparently not very often at it since less than a score of the over seven hundred footnotes are references to original material — "original" in this case means not the records themselves but the PAC finding aid! He gives the usual lines of gratitude to research assistants and indeed it is probable that there is the work of several hands here — but none of them apparently belonged to an editor. The Public Archives of Canada appears in some places under that

title and in others as the National Archives of Canada. Talbot refers to his republished calendar as an "annotated bibliography" when it is neither annotated nor a bibliography. Still visible on at least one page are pencilled corrections which have not been retyped.

Finally, what of Talbot's work with the calendar itself? He tells us "a search was made of over 100,000 items" and that "descriptions were prepared for each item relating to criminal justice." This suggests a recent and personal activity when in fact the descriptions were prepared by PAC archivists working over a twenty-year span and not by Talbot or his research assistants. Talbot has prepared an index of names from the finding aid which may prove a shortcut but a random sampling showed several missing references. The PAC finding aid is not under review here but from having used it I know that some care was involved in its creation and a useful if somewhat overwhelming research tool is available. The same can hardly be said for *Justice in Early Ontario*.

H.T. Holman
Ottawa

East Georgian Bay Historical Journal, Vols. 1 and 2, 1981-82. East Georgian Bay Historical Foundation.

To quote from the introduction given in the inaugural issue, this annual journal was initiated in 1981 "to serve as a forum for the exchange of historical knowledge and thereby promote the more extensive use of the Simcoe County Archives and demonstrate the need for archival institutions in the District of Muskoka and the District of Parry Sound." The idea of an archives being involved in the publishing of something other than its finding aids may strike many as novel. Worse still, publishing an historical journal means being involved with historians — and local ones at that! I am truly relieved to report the combination works! This journal manages both to satisfy the reader interested in local history and to publicize the archival holdings and, not incidentally, the repositories in which the research for many of the articles was done.

"The Town of Barrie in 1853" by Gary E. French appears in Volume 1. It is a detailed analysis of an 1853 watercolour of the town of Barrie by Captain W.H. Grubbe (Fred Grant Collection, Simcoe County Archives) and an 1856 lithograph of the town by H. Scobie, based on another watercolour by W.H. Grubbe housed at Metro Toronto Library. The author provides the historical background for nearly all of the over one hundred structures appearing in these sources. For each building, the author provides the owners, occupants, and purpose for the building. He also includes the dates of construction and demolition, when known. Granted, the article itself does not read as smoothly as an article in, say *Ontario History*, but this does not take away from the essential value of the article. In admirable fashion it publicizes the existence of specific primary documents, the locations of the collections — Simcoe County Archives and the Metro Toronto Library — and provides noteworthy information about the early history of the town of Barrie.

The *East Georgian Bay Historical Journal* is not devoted entirely to analyzing and publicizing archival documents. "Muskoka Wood Manufacturing" by Roger Bragg appears in Volume II. It is a narrative history of the many logging companies that operated in the Muskoka area and the impact each had on both the industry and the community in general. The article is surely ideal for a journal of local history. Industrial histories at the