

title and in others as the National Archives of Canada. Talbot refers to his republished calendar as an "annotated bibliography" when it is neither annotated nor a bibliography. Still visible on at least one page are pencilled corrections which have not been retyped.

Finally, what of Talbot's work with the calendar itself? He tells us "a search was made of over 100,000 items" and that "descriptions were prepared for each item relating to criminal justice." This suggests a recent and personal activity when in fact the descriptions were prepared by PAC archivists working over a twenty-year span and not by Talbot or his research assistants. Talbot has prepared an index of names from the finding aid which may prove a shortcut but a random sampling showed several missing references. The PAC finding aid is not under review here but from having used it I know that some care was involved in its creation and a useful if somewhat overwhelming research tool is available. The same can hardly be said for *Justice in Early Ontario*.

H.T. Holman
Ottawa

East Georgian Bay Historical Journal, Vols. 1 and 2, 1981-82. East Georgian Bay Historical Foundation.

To quote from the introduction given in the inaugural issue, this annual journal was initiated in 1981 "to serve as a forum for the exchange of historical knowledge and thereby promote the more extensive use of the Simcoe County Archives and demonstrate the need for archival institutions in the District of Muskoka and the District of Parry Sound." The idea of an archives being involved in the publishing of something other than its finding aids may strike many as novel. Worse still, publishing an historical journal means being involved with historians — and local ones at that! I am truly relieved to report the combination works! This journal manages both to satisfy the reader interested in local history and to publicize the archival holdings and, not incidentally, the repositories in which the research for many of the articles was done.

"The Town of Barrie in 1853" by Gary E. French appears in Volume 1. It is a detailed analysis of an 1853 watercolour of the town of Barrie by Captain W.H. Grubbe (Fred Grant Collection, Simcoe County Archives) and an 1856 lithograph of the town by H. Scobie, based on another watercolour by W.H. Grubbe housed at Metro Toronto Library. The author provides the historical background for nearly all of the over one hundred structures appearing in these sources. For each building, the author provides the owners, occupants, and purpose for the building. He also includes the dates of construction and demolition, when known. Granted, the article itself does not read as smoothly as an article in, say *Ontario History*, but this does not take away from the essential value of the article. In admirable fashion it publicizes the existence of specific primary documents, the locations of the collections — Simcoe County Archives and the Metro Toronto Library — and provides noteworthy information about the early history of the town of Barrie.

The *East Georgian Bay Historical Journal* is not devoted entirely to analyzing and publicizing archival documents. "Muskoka Wood Manufacturing" by Roger Bragg appears in Volume II. It is a narrative history of the many logging companies that operated in the Muskoka area and the impact each had on both the industry and the community in general. The article is surely ideal for a journal of local history. Industrial histories at the

local level are rare. It is refreshing to see a local history publication containing something other than church and family histories. This article is useful, too, as a counterbalance to articles discussing primary documents. In this way, the journal can appeal to a broader readership.

The reputation of the Simcoe County Archives is enhanced by the professional quality of this publication. As well, the East Georgian Bay Historical Foundation deserves credit for recognizing the need to promote the use of its local archives and for doing something concrete about it.

Mike Proudlock
Region of Peel Archives

The Poet and the Critic: A Literary Correspondence Between D.C. Scott and E.K. Brown. ROBERT L. McDOUGALL, ed. Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1983. 308 p. ISBN 0-88629-011-2.

E.J. Pratt: The Truant Years, 1882-1927. DAVID G. PITT. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984. xix, 415 p. ISBN 0-920502-39-3.

These two volumes form an interesting pair for archival review. Perhaps the first point of professional interest is the perilous existence of primary sources. How much archival material has been inadvertently lost? The contrite unfortunate who did not recognize familial talent early enough — “How did I know that he [Pratt] was going to be famous?” — deserves our sympathy. One is less tolerant of the loss of Lampman’s letters, which seem to have vanished. And gratitude seems too mild a response to those who in “an inspired moment scooped” up two boxes of Scott Papers from what must have been the brink of extinction. Authors, though with more right, can themselves pose threats to the record. When Pratt destroyed an early poem which had reduced his fiancée to gales of laughter, perhaps no more than historical curiosity suffered. On the other hand, the poet could have missed an important lesson about his art, later gleaned from a “cold critical” reading of *Clay*, had not Mrs. Pratt salvaged one copy when its disappointed author “tore the tremendous manuscript to shreds in all its copies and sent them into the flames.” Similarly, Duncan Campbell Scott cannot date published poems for Brown because “lately [his] lyrics were scribbled on bits of paper that were destroyed”

Researchers, too, can leave tracks which are difficult to follow. Understandably, David Pitt cites locations for his sources at the time he used them. It is possible to lose the trail to those in private hands, however, as indeed was the case for nearly twenty years, from Bourinot to McDougall, for the Scott-Aylen Papers. Perhaps only the archival heart shivers to read that Brown went back to Cornell well stocked with Lampman manuscripts, but the conservator should experience a similar *frisson* to learn that one notebook was “in bad condition, cover gone, and some pages, very yellow” Alas, too, Brown’s study wall was decorated with some “framed ms. poems of A.L.” Admiration, it appears, can take its own toll.

The Scott-Brown letters reveal a nicely defined episode in the lives of a poet and a critic and, as a bonus, give us a Chinese box view of an editor watching editors at work, as Brown and Scott prepare Lampman’s poems for posthumous publication. Since editions of letters and manuscripts are sometimes said to devalue the originals, it is interesting to