BOOK REVIEWS

records of the Ontario government, local historical records and newspapers for Elora and Wellington County, and the work of a good variety of local and family historians and librarians both in Ontario and Scotland. Especially gratifying is Killan's use of American ethnological archives (such as those of the Smithsonian Institution and Harvard's Peabody Museum) which hold rich but frequently overlooked documentation on early Canadian anthropological research. Also well covered in Killan's sources are the academic, governmental, and popular periodical literature of the time. One complaint might be that Killan's Scottish sources, and in particular those for the early history of Boyle's family, are not clearly defined. He acknowledges having received from a family historian what is obviously detailed genealogical information on Boyle's family back to the eighteenth century, but no specific archival references are cited. Readers who may wish to pursue similar lines of research or (unlikely as it might be) to verify his facts, are thus frustrated. This aside, the main body of Killan's references are admirably clear and complete.

David Boyle is an outstanding example of what social/cultural anthropologists may still call (in what I remember as a tone of disparagement) "interdisciplinary" social science. In fact it is good history, good anthropology, and an encouragement to both disciplines to understand one another. We still have no adequate history of our national ethnological service (the National Museum of Man) and its notable officers, nor indeed of any other major Canadian ethnological museum. Aside from Morris Zaslow's useful historical roundup in *Reading the Rocks* (1975), there is no evaluation of the remarkable nineteenth-century anthropological researches of the Geological Survey of Canada; no published review of the history of evolutionary theory in Canada (although interesting thesis work exists); no analysis of the social theories of the missionaries who were the closest and earliest European students of the native peoples of Canada; no history of anthropological instruction in the universities — the list could go on. It is to be hoped that Killan's careful research and admirable writing will guide and encourage other scholars in both history and anthropology on the ground where the two overlap.

> **Bennett McCardle** Federal Archives Division Public Archives of Canada

Moon of Wintertime: Missionaries and the Indians of Canada in Encounter Since 1534. JOHN WEBSTER GRANT. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984. xx, 315 p. ISBN 0-8020-6541-4.

Religion in Life at Louisbourg, 1713-1758. A.J.B. JOHNSTON. Kingston and Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1984. xxxii, 223 p. ISBN 0-7735-0427-3.

'Twas in the moon of winter time, when all the birds had fled, that mighty Gitchi Manitou sent angel choirs instead....

Most home-grown Canadian readers will be quick to recognize the derivation of the title of Professor Grant's study of missionary-Indian encounters in J.E. Middleton's rendering of the carol attributed to Brébeuf. It is intended to "call attention to the significant circumstance that when most Indians were introduced to Christianity, the bird and animal spirits to which they had looked for illumination were no longer readily found in their

ARCHIVARIA 21

accustomed places or seemed already to have fled from them." *Moon of Wintertime* is essentially an analysis of the impact on Indian culture of European culture (which was inextricably mingled with the religion of the missionaries) and of the effects which that cultural collision had upon the transmission of Christianity to Canada's Indians. Its thesis is that the clash of the two cultures damaged that of the Indians in a manner which initially reduced their resistance to the new religion but which ultimately inhibited their ability to receive the new faith in a way that would make it truly their own.

Although impartially critical of the missionary achievement of all denominations, Professor Grant does not make the current common mistake of judging the missionaries outside of their historical contexts or apart from their spiritual objectives. On the contrary, he shows genuine sensitivity toward the viewpoints of missionaries and Indians alike and much sympathy with both in the frustrations occasioned by the unsatisfactory transmission of Christianity that resulted from the nature of the cultural difficulties experienced. The clarity and charity of his very perceptive analysis could well prove to be notable contributions to the promotion of that understanding between modern churches and Indians which must be fostered if the inadequacies of the historical encounters between their forbears are ever to be overcome.

The analysis of the terms of the Indian-Christian encounter and their consequences was originally, as the author explains in his preface, all that he had in mind. The lack of a ready-made global narrative on which to base his analysis, however, virtually forced him to provide his own. This statement should not lead the reader to expect that the bonus offered by *Moon of Wintertime* is in the nature of a textbook reference work, systematically supplying information by denominations, areas, or periods. The author assumes in his readers a very fair general knowledge of the subject that obviates such a pedestrian approach. One could wish that he had not also assumed a detailed knowledge of his sources and had supplied somewhat less abbreviated references in his numerous notes. Those to the copies of the Church Missionary Society's records at the Public Archives of Canada, for example, are extremely cryptic and quite heedless of the suggestions made in the PAC's *Archival Citations*. What is furnished is simply a bird's-eye view of 450 years of missionary-Indian encounters, which concentrates on broad patterns and principles rather than on factual minutiae. The archival sources utilized are obvious ones with documents sometimes quoted from secondary works.

In these days of specialization and the supremacy of scholarly monographs, it is a brave historian who attempts this type of integrative writing and readers have reason to be grateful to Professor Grant, not only for his courage and the breadth of his vision but also for the skill and flair with which he has executed his very large secondary undertaking.

Where breadth is the keynote of Professor Grant's *tour de force*, A.J.B. Johnston's study of religion in Louisbourg, 1713-1758, is by contrast narrow. It is a narrowness not of mind, however, but of space and time, inherent in the isolation, peculiar circumstances, and very brief history of Louisbourg. His treatment of his strictly circumscribed subject is most thorough, and considerable ingenuity has been used to force records of marginal natural relevance for his topic into yielding relevant data by means of deductive techniques. One feels that every scrap of available documentation has been scrutinized and pressed into service if at all possible. The truth is that among the plethora of records which survive for the Louisbourg settlement there is a dearth of personal letters, diaries, memoirs, and meditations — the type of material most needed for writing a satisfactory

BOOK REVIEWS

history of an interior human activity such as the practice of religion. In their absence, it has been necessary to concentrate on the recorded externals of religious observance and morals, derived from such sources as parish registers, official correspondence, reports, census and court records, wills and inventories, maps and archaeological discoveries. There is some strain and some frustration in the method, but one is happy to see the importance of religion recognized, in addition to that of warfare, business, and other social concerns of the settlement. Moreover, the title of the book has been chosen with care so as to give an accurate idea of its contents and not raise unfounded hopes. The result is a comprehensive and helpful examination of a limited subject, clearly and pleasantly written.

The background of this study is well presented in the introduction and illustrated with relevant maps, drawings, and photographs of reconstructions and artifacts, so that even a reader's lack of knowledge of the highly specialized subject should not greatly impair his understanding of the work. The first chapter provides the general religious context and the next three chapters deal respectively with the three religious orders that served the settlement of Louisbourg: the Récollets of Brittany, who ministered as curés and chaplains; the Brothers of Charity of Saint John of God, who staffed the King's Hospital; and the Sisters of the Congregation of Notre-Dame, who strove to provide education for the Louisbourg girls. Three corresponding appendices provide the names and all available information on the various members of these orders known to have been stationed in Louisbourg at any time. The final chapter deals with faith, morals, and popular customs regarding birth and baptism; confession, communion, and confirmation; sex and marriage; death and burial.

The dry bones of names, dates, and statistics are, wherever possible, fleshed out with accounts of personalities, both among the religious and the lay population, and of the courageous persistence of the three orders in spite of inadequate numbers, rivalries, conflicts with the secular authorities, and the remarkable lack of financial generosity exhibited by the "Louisbourgeois," who refused to pay a compulsory tithe or to support the building of a parish church. This last is tentatively attributed by the author to the fact that all Louisbourg's most significant buildings — the fortifications, barracks, official residences, hospital, and lighthouse — were erected at royal expense, so that the inhabitants may have anticipated a twentieth-century version of dependence on "the government" to supply all their communal needs. It is the occasional interpretive gem of this sort that makes this study of an untypical and isolated community rewarding even for the non-specialist.

Patricia Birkett

Manuscript Division Public Archives of Canada

Rendezvous: Selected Papers of the Fourth North American Fur Trade Conference, 1981. THOMAS C. BUCKLEY, ed. St. Paul: North American Fur Trade Conference, 1984. (Available from the North American Fur Trade Conference, 240 Summit Avenue, St. Paul, Minnesota, 55102.) ISBN 0-9613451-0-1.

Cold print is incapable of capturing the essence of the Fourth North American Fur Trade Conference held in October 1981 in Grand Portage, Minnesota and Thunder Bay,