small archives should be a model for all social historians and especially for those who feel research begins and ends with the provincial and national archives. Furthermore, his synthesis utilizes both primary and the most up-to-date secondary literature. Grant is not only in touch with the current research, he is in fact at its forefront.

The monograph is also eminently readable by both the specialist and the generalist. The chapters are short, easily digested, and permit a quick review for reference purposes. With its keen evaluation of people and circumstances, it contributes to the current demythologizing of such characters as John Strachan and Egerton Ryerson and attacks long-held misconceptions about Ontario's history. Also, while it is not sidetracked by unrepresentative anecdotes, Grant's keen wit and finely understated sense of humour shine through.

The book has only minor weaknesses. While it is very handsome, and a real tribute to the editors at the University of Toronto Press, it would have been preferable to have the photographs distributed throughout the work rather than congregated at the beginning. Also, a map of early Ontario would help the uninitiated in locating the small religious groups. A bibliography, although now frowned upon by cost-conscious publishers, would have been a real asset, especially since religious history is almost never distinguished as a distinct field of historical endeavour in this country.

Slightly more substantial, Grant, despite his warning of its inaccuracy, places rather too much emphasis on the religious Census of 1842. In at least three places it is used as a basis for comparison and, while the conclusions drawn may be correct, the census's well-known biases are cause for concern. Also, this reviewer thinks that early Ontarians suffered from a lack of interest in religion rather than simply a lack of support for specific denominations, and suspects that Deism and the remnants of eighteenth-century secular rationalism were more pervasive than Grant admits. This is, however, a disagreement only as to degree and, in any event, hard evidence is unavailable.

However, the book's great strengths must quickly be reaffirmed. Grant mixes the knowledge of a specialist with the maturity of one who has long surveyed the whole religious fabric of Canada and abroad. The book sustains his reputation as Canada's foremost religious historian. At the same time, it fulfils the valuable task of opening up countless fields of research for the coming generation of social historians. The monograph will long serve as a textbook, both in content and style, for those interested in religion in Canada, and will perhaps be most useful for those who rarely consider religion when assessing Canada's development.

Neil Semple
Victoria University

The Social Uplifters: Presbyterian Progressives and the Social Gospel in Canada, 1875-1915. BRIAN J. FRASER. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1988. xv, 212 p. ISBN 0-88920-972-3.

In *The Social Uplifters*, Brian Fraser discusses an influential group of moral and social reformers of the Presbyterian Church in Canada during the early years of this century. He selects six individuals — Robert A. Falconer, Charles W. Gordon, Thomas B. Kilpatrick, James A. Macdonald, George C. Pidgeon, and John G. Shearer — who

stood out as leaders and who regularly collaborated with one another. In contrast with earlier writers who have anchored their accounts of Presbyterian social thought on Queen's University with its Church of Scotland tradition, Fraser emphasizes the contribution of the more evangelical Free Church of Scotland. He bases his account mainly on the published writings and private papers of the representative leaders he has chosen, supplemented by the works of the theologians and philosophers on whom they drew and by the official records of the Presbyterian Church in Canada. In addition to the archives of the United Church of Canada, Knox College, and the University of Toronto, he has consulted the Laurier and King papers at the National Archives of Canada.

Fraser traces the ideas of his cast largely to British idealist philosophers of the late nineteenth century, especially by way of such Free Church thinkers as Edward Caird and Henry Drummond. Faced with the challenge of evolutionary science and the higher criticism of the Bible, these writers sought to restore the credibility of Christian faith by finding in the revelation of God in Jesus Christ the basis of a coherent view of the universe. From this theology of coherence, they inferred, in conscious opposition to the individualism that had long dominated Protestant thought, a vision of society as an organic whole. Novel in some respects, this vision was essentially conservative. Society was to be, not radically transformed, but rather secured and perfected on its existing, allegedly Christian base.

The representative leaders studied by Fraser made this understanding of the cosmos and of society the basis of energetic campaigns of moral and social reform that embraced such diverse causes as temperance, Sabbath observance, sexual purity, political probity, the assimilation of non-British immigrants, and church union. Unlike some of the unconventional thinkers described by Ramsay Cook in *The Regenerators*, a work with which similarity of title inevitably suggests comparison, they desired not to subvert the doctrines of their church but to use modern ideas to ground them more securely. Neither were they more radical in their social approach than their Scottish mentors, but rather they were middle-class Protestants of British origin who saw in the adoption of their folkways a sovereign remedy for social deviation and division. As evangelicals, they looked for results primarily from personal conversions that only the church could bring about, though always in collaboration with the Christian home, the public school, the university, and the press.

During the first decade or so of this century, these people and others of like mind virtually controlled the national apparatus of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, setting up an ambitious bureaucracy to achieve their ends. Their crusade broke down, however, in the crisis precipitated by the outbreak of the First World War. The immediate cause was a lack of financial support, which in 1915 ended the separate existence of the Board of Social Service and Evangelism through which the bulk of reformist energies had been channelled. More fundamentally, according to Fraser, changing times overtook a simplistic and essentially nostalgic programme.

Fraser has provided a solid, well-written, and much-needed addition to the literature of the social gospel in Canada. For a general view of the movement, one must still turn to Richard Allen's *The Social Passion*. In *We Stand on Their Shoulders*, Edward A. Pulker called attention to a distinctive Anglican strain largely ignored by Allen. Fraser has now filled in another, perhaps even more significant, band of the spectrum. Despite their failure to achieve their main objectives, the leaders he discusses profoundly affected

the Presbyterian unionist mind, and thus ensured prolonged currency to their emphases within the United Church of Canada.

Inevitably, and properly, the book raises questions which call for further investigation. How far, for example, were the Queen's-based, Kirk-oriented approach to society and that represented by Fraser's selected leaders complementary, how far (as George Pidgeon suggested) incompatible and competitive? Could one say, as this reviewer should be inclined to, that the inclusive vision of church union proposed by George Monro Grant in 1874 was to a considerable extent overtaken and superseded by another, more programmatic one? More generally, is it more appropriate to speak of "the Social Gospel" or of overlapping but far from identical social gospels?

Fraser sees "the dynamic, competitive spirit of the Free Church" as the predominant factor in determining the ethos of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, and in particular the views of the leaders he discusses. He argues both claims convincingly, but they betray him at times into a kind of Free Church imperialism. He states, for example, that seventy-five per cent of the original membership of the Presbyterian Church in Canada was of Free Church background, when in fact this proportion represents the combined strength of bodies which had resulted from earlier Free Church-Secession unions. On the paternal side, at least, Pidgeon and Falconer were of Seceder background. The Presbyterian College in Halifax, identified here without qualification as one of "the Free Church colleges," had a strong Seceder component and was presided over for many years by a former Kirkman. The offspring of unions, like those of marriages, have a way of favouring different parts of their ancestry at various stages of development.

Fraser reminds us repeatedly that Presbyterian reformers stopped short of pressing for radical changes in the social fabric. He is right, but his apparent assumption that they thereby self-evidently stand condemned recalls the whiggishness of an earlier generation of historians. They believed in middle-class values and saw no need to apologize for them. Even today the causes which stir the greatest enthusiasm call for a radical transformation of society only implicitly if at all. With many of them, such as the preservation of urban neighbourhoods, the protection of the environment, the banning of the bomb, and the elimination of tobacco, they would have felt very much at home. Perhaps their ghosts linger on, along with their conviction that what most urgently needs to be changed is the human consciousness.

These qualifications do not detract from the value or importance of this penetrating study. Along with much food for thought, it offers at the beginning a delightful spoof on social reformers and at the end a very prescient quotation from Laurier.

John Webster Grant
Victoria University

An Evangelical Mind: Nathanael Burwash and the Methodist Tradition in Canada, 1839-1918. MARGUERITE VAN DIE. Kingston, Montreal, London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1989. viii, 280 p. ISBN 0-7735-0695-0 $32.95E.

This book is the third in a series titled McGill-Queen's Studies in the History of Religion and supported by the Jackman Foundation of Toronto. The author teaches at Queen's Theological College and in the Department of History at Queen's University. This is her