

the Presbyterian unionist mind, and thus ensured prolonged currency to their emphases within the United Church of Canada.

Inevitably, and properly, the book raises questions which call for further investigation. How far, for example, were the Queen's-based, Kirk-oriented approach to society and that represented by Fraser's selected leaders complementary, how far (as George Pidgeon suggested) incompatible and competitive? Could one say, as this reviewer should be inclined to, that the inclusive vision of church union proposed by George Monro Grant in 1874 was to a considerable extent overtaken and superseded by another, more programmatic one? More generally, is it more appropriate to speak of "the Social Gospel" or of overlapping but far from identical social gospels?

Fraser sees "the dynamic, competitive spirit of the Free Church" as the predominant factor in determining the ethos of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, and in particular the views of the leaders he discusses. He argues both claims convincingly, but they betray him at times into a kind of Free Church imperialism. He states, for example, that seventy-five per cent of the original membership of the Presbyterian Church in Canada was of Free Church background, when in fact this proportion represents the combined strength of bodies which had resulted from earlier Free Church-Secession unions. On the paternal side, at least, Pidgeon and Falconer were of Seceder background. The Presbyterian College in Halifax, identified here without qualification as one of "the Free Church colleges," had a strong Seceder component and was presided over for many years by a former Kirkman. The offspring of unions, like those of marriages, have a way of favouring different parts of their ancestry at various stages of development.

Fraser reminds us repeatedly that Presbyterian reformers stopped short of pressing for radical changes in the social fabric. He is right, but his apparent assumption that they thereby self-evidently stand condemned recalls the whiggishness of an earlier generation of historians. They believed in middle-class values and saw no need to apologize for them. Even today the causes which stir the greatest enthusiasm call for a radical transformation of society only implicitly if at all. With many of them, such as the preservation of urban neighbourhoods, the protection of the environment, the banning of the bomb, and the elimination of tobacco, they would have felt very much at home. Perhaps their ghosts linger on, along with their conviction that what most urgently needs to be changed is the human consciousness.

These qualifications do not detract from the value or importance of this penetrating study. Along with much food for thought, it offers at the beginning a delightful spoof on social reformers and at the end a very prescient quotation from Laurier.

John Webster Grant
Victoria University

An Evangelical Mind: Nathanael Burwash and the Methodist Tradition in Canada, 1839-1918. MARGUERITE VAN DIE. Kingston, Montreal, London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1989. viii, 280 p. ISBN 0-7735-0695-0 \$32.95E.

This book is the third in a series titled McGill-Queen's Studies in the History of Religion and supported by the Jackman Foundation of Toronto. The author teaches at Queen's Theological College and in the Department of History at Queen's University. This is her

first book, and it makes an important contribution to historical scholarship because of its fresh interpretation of a crucial period in the religious and intellectual history of English Canada. At the same time, its publication should remind archivists of the close relationship between archival description and historical writing.

An Evangelical Mind is not intended to be, in the first place, a biography of Nathanael Burwash. Rather, the author's primary purpose is to explore the nature and influence of nineteenth-century evangelicalism in Canada by examining the life and thought of one of its most influential exponents. Although Burwash was a prominent figure in his own time, he has received very little attention from contemporary scholars. Van Die tries to show that a study of Burwash's outlook can provide a better understanding of English Canadian culture not only in his lifetime but also well into the twentieth century.

As portrayed in the book, Burwash bore on his character and outlook, to the end of his days, the indelible stamp of his Loyalist parents and especially of his deeply pious mother. He underwent evangelical conversion at a youthful age but struggled with the conflicting claims of religion and science at college and in his early years as a Methodist minister. After intensive personal study, he resolved the conflict in his own mind and went on to serve some of the more prominent circuits in Ontario. His close contact with the increasingly affluent and educated laity in his Toronto and Hamilton stations led Burwash to view theological education as the key to keeping the Methodist ministry in tune with changing times. In the year of Canada's Confederation he accepted an appointment to Victoria College (later Victoria University) in Cobourg, where he first taught science and later theology. By adopting Francis Bacon's inductive approach to science and retaining the evangelical approach of John Wesley to theology, he was able to come to terms with the higher criticism of the Bible. After his appointment as president of Victoria in 1887, his role in controversies which rocked not only the school but also the entire Methodist Church revealed his openness to new approaches but also his loyalty to his basic evangelical experience. A firm belief in the ultimate harmony of faith and reason led him to argue that university federation — with the sciences taught by the secular University of Toronto and the humanities by associated denominational colleges — was the key to building a first-rate system of higher education in Canada. This same outlook led him to view a union of the major Protestant denominations as essential to the building of a strong and progressive Canada. Burwash played a leading role in the federation of Victoria University with the University of Toronto in 1890, and helped lay the groundwork for church union which was accomplished seven years after his death in 1918.

The structure of *An Evangelical Mind* combines a thematic and a chronological approach, with each chapter treating a period in Burwash's life but also focusing on a significant issue involving Methodism in its Canadian context. This approach, though complex, is handled successfully by the author. What emerges by the end of the book is not only a vivid picture of Burwash's inner spiritual struggles and his role on various institutional battlefields, but also a reinterpretation of the broader subject of evangelicalism and its adjustment to the enormous changes taking place in Canadian society.

Van Die draws conclusions from her study which mark a departure from previous studies of this broader subject. Other scholars, most notably Ramsay Cook in his outstanding work *The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada*

(1985), have generally viewed the period between Confederation and the First World War as one leading to the decline of Protestant Christianity as a pervasive influence in English Canadian life. Van Die's study of Burwash led her to conclude that although there were significant changes in his outlook there was also a significant continuity of evangelical belief. Her interpretation suggests that Burwash was not struggling with a process of secularization unique to his times, but rather with a tension between faith and reason, between divine purpose and human responsibility, which has been present throughout the history of the Christian church and which has provoked a variety of responses. She argues that Burwash's response to this ongoing tension was a dual commitment to Baconian science and Wesleyan theology, which allowed him to be open to cultural change but at the same time to retain his "inner assurance of faith." Furthermore, she argues that Burwash's central place in Canadian Methodism allowed his outlook to have a significant impact not only in his own day, but also for decades to follow on institutions such as the University of Toronto and the future United Church of Canada.

The endnotes and list of sources at the end of the book indicate that Van Die did most of her primary research in the United Church of Canada/Victoria University Archives in Toronto, where the papers of Nathanael Burwash and most of the records of Canadian Methodism are held. Prior to the period of her research, the extensive Burwash material had largely been inaccessible. Dispersed to several locations around the Victoria University campus after the departure of its creator from the scene, only a part of the material was transferred to the archives and described in a finding aid. This situation undoubtedly accounted in some measure for the lack of attention Burwash received in previous scholarship.

Van Die began her research on her doctoral dissertation in 1982 at about the same time that the archives was undertaking to gather together and describe in some detail the Burwash material which could be identified. This project influenced the direction of her research, and with the help of a new and much enlarged finding aid she was able to use a good deal of archival material which hitherto had been unavailable. The dissertation led to *An Evangelical Mind*. In this instance, a relationship between the production of a descriptive tool in an archives and the production of a scholarly study was an obvious one.

One criticism of the use of primary sources in the book could be mentioned. Although the available textual material was quite thoroughly utilized, the available graphic material was not. A selection of photographs of Burwash and his close relatives is reproduced, but only one other important figure in the book is pictured. Photographs of other significant figures in Canadian Methodism are available in the United Church/Victoria University Archives but were not used. In addition, while a modern pen drawing of Victoria College in Toronto was reproduced, excellent archival photographs of Victoria buildings in Cobourg and Toronto were not. A picture of Burwash Hall, which is mentioned in the first line of the introduction as a symbol of what Burwash was trying to achieve, is available and would have helped to make the author's point.

The body of the book is well organized. As one would expect from a publication based on a dissertation, the text is densely packed with information and there is a good deal of discussion of related scholarship. The sections dealing with Burwash's inner spiritual struggles are presented in a particularly sensitive and compelling way. Unfortunately,

the structure of the book's concluding section is less effective. New and important material is introduced here which might more appropriately have been included in the body of the text, and the author's conclusions drawn from the study could have been stated more concisely and forcefully.

On balance, *An Evangelical Mind* is a well-researched and well-presented book which makes an important contribution to the world of scholarship with its reinterpretation of a crucial period in the religious and intellectual history of English Canada. For archivists, it can also serve as a reminder of the close relationship between the description of archival material and the writing of history.

Mark van Stempvoort

United Church of Canada/Victoria
University Archives

The First Bishop: A Biography of Charles Inglis. BRIAN CUTHBERTSON. Halifax: Waegwoltic Press, 1987. 292 p. ISBN 0-9692970-0-9.

Eighteenth-century bishops generally give biographers a hard time. Details of the maintenance of a wealthy, established, and intensely conservative church in close alliance with the state as joint guardians of a status quo overripe for change can make for tedious reading. Good works do not always make good copy, and piety without a dash of venality or other human frailty will not hold the reader for long. Trollope wisely omitted most of the episcopal activity (or inactivity) at Barchester in favour of domestic and political entanglements, for that diocese was very much of the eighteenth century. Most prelates of the secular Age of Enlightenment come down to us as embalmed as their engravings and portraits in oils which say so little about them that we would really like to know.

In fairness, however, the eighteenth-century Church of England was not all dust and drowsiness; its latitude had a healing quality in contrast to the two preceding centuries of vicious religious conflict. Charles Inglis grew up with this background, but as a young missionary was plunged into an ethos which in some senses was to echo those earlier centuries of religious strife and civil war. There are those, like Judith Fingard in the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* (volume V), who see his inclination towards reconciliation, compromise, and light administrative hand to be a search for the easy life in a harsh world. Brian Cuthbertson gives us a portrait, which is eminently believable, of a man exhibiting conviction, patient courage, an abiding faith, and limitations which erred on the side of omission rather than commission, which may be an Anglican characteristic not without its value.

The author, who was a public records archivist in the Public Archives of Nova Scotia for several years, provides a critical appraisal of his sources which helps to explain why a definitive account of Inglis may remain elusive: almost no letters to him have survived; there is little beyond official correspondence and few exchanges between him and his clergy; no answers to his visitation questionnaires and no account books to detail his financial difficulties exist. Evidence for his early life is minimal, and domestic correspondence is almost nonexistent. What does survive in large measure are his letters to the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG) and the Archbishop of Canterbury, which may at times be self-serving. Cuthbertson uses all this admittedly ill-