

By grace co-workers. Building the Anglican Diocese of Toronto 1780-1989. ALAN L. HAYES, ed. Toronto: Anglican Book Centre, 1989. 332 p. ISBN 0-921846-15-0 \$15.00 (cloth).

This volume, issued to mark the 150th anniversary of the Diocese of Toronto, contains contributions from nine Anglicans, the majority of whom are professional historians and whose goal is “to tell our diocesan story accurately, to see it in fresh perspective, and to relate it to its social context” (p. 13).

The work falls into four parts: A — History (chapters by Robert Black, Alan Hayes, and Black again, using 1867 and 1939 as the points of division), B — Parish Life (Elwood Jones on the growth of the diocese; Paul Friesen and Richard Ruggle on parish life), C — Government (chapters by Shirley Spragge (1780-1867) and Hayes (1867-1939) on management and finance, and D — Diocesan Programs (Frank Peake on church education in the diocese, and Bishop Snell on the Anglican Congress of 1963).

Volumes of multiple authorship always run the risk of a lack of overall unity, and unfortunately *By grace co-workers* does not avoid this pitfall. The various parts have not been worked into a coherent whole. There is no overall bibliography and, unacceptable in a volume of professional scholarship, no index. There are several discussions of the same point, but no way to gather them all together. For example, John Strachan, the founding bishop, is discussed by Black, by Jones, by Friesen, and again by Spragge, but in piecemeal fashion (for example, Spragge on financial administration and Jones on the role of the laity). The role of women and women’s organizations are mentioned, but again variously, by Black, Hayes, Friesen, Ruggle, and Hayes (with a telling comment: “By rights, as large a portion of this book should be devoted to the women of the diocese as to the men, but unfortunately the surviving documentation is exceedingly sparse”). Sometimes repeated discussion is useful — for example, Jones argues that Strachan’s invitation of the laity to the “synod” of 1851 was not so much his response to the demands of the laity or an experiment based on experiences elsewhere, but Strachan’s attempt to co-opt lay support in the battle over the clergy reserves. But on the whole, the various chapters are independent of each other, and one misses an overall editorial hand.

The three historical chapters provide an informative and constantly moving account of the diocese from its earliest beginnings. The authors have wisely chosen to restrict their discussion to the present-day boundaries of the diocese and not to stray into the areas now occupied by the daughter dioceses of Huron, Niagara, Ontario/Ottawa, and Algoma. The division at 1867 makes sense as both the year of Confederation and the demise of John Strachan, but 1939 is a purely secular date, and one could have made a case for 1932 (the election of Owen as fifth bishop).

Much of Black’s first chapter, dealing with the attempt to “establish” the Church of England as the official state church in Upper Canada and with the ongoing issue of the clergy reserves, assumes the reader’s familiarity with these issues, rather optimistically so. The actual creation of the diocese is attributed by Black in part as an imperial reaction to the disturbances at Toronto in 1837; intriguing parallels are noted elsewhere in the empire. One would have liked more details about the creation and about Black’s claim that “the early diocese of Toronto was Strachan’s in more ways than one” (p. 32). Jones does mention the visit by Bishop Mountain in 1838, but again it is not clear whether the creation of the new diocese was the occasion of the result of his visit. The chapter dies away, as if there was nothing of moment after the creation of the Huron diocese in 1857, and Strachan himself vanishes abruptly from the narrative.

Hayes's chapter is an especially clear and good account of the episcopates of Bethune, Steadman, and Sweeny, all elected as compromise candidates in bitterly contested elections (1867, 1879, 1909). Hayes sees Bethune's episcopacy as a low point both in terms of morale and of administration (as his later chapter makes plain), Steadman's as an era of reconstruction and reorganization, and Sweeny's as an age of social gospel and concern with and for the secular world. The easy and uncontroversial election of Owen in 1932 reveals how far the diocese had come. At times Hayes writes with the benefit of hindsight, for example, when discussing the lay concerns of the 1870s as an inevitable development, or the social gospel of the 1920s. On page 72 he states that "not all Anglicans appreciated the trend to a social gospel," and later does allow that social gospel depended upon the "optimistic view of human nature" (p. 89) which the war was to dispel, but surely opposition consisted of more than one lay member. Similarly in his discussion of high churchmen and evangelicals, one feels a small bias towards the latter, with no hint that the former represent the unique Anglican blend of ecclesiastical tradition, scriptural authority, and human reason. Did anything distinguish Anglican evangelicals from Protestant evangelicals? What was *Anglican* about them?

Black's second chapter is the only discussion in depth of the "modern period." The other sections deal only with the periods 1780-1867 and 1867-1939. Black's contribution was, it must be admitted, a last-minute replacement for a "no-show," and he is to be commended for producing an account of the episcopates of Owen, Beverley, Wilkinson, Snell, and Garnsworthy in so short a time. The episcopacy of Wilkinson (1955-1966) appears as a high point in the diocese, although Black is careful to observe the tumultuous background of the day. He quotes Wilkinson for "the impatience with authority and tradition shown by the new age, general cynicism . . . under the nuclear shadow, and . . . a widespread idolatry of scientific knowledge and 'relevance'" (p. 118). One can observe that the major reply to scientism (p. 111) was made by Toronto Anglican Dr. D.R.G. Owen in his *Scientism, Man and Religion* (1952).

The problem is that as one approaches the present, it becomes harder to write with equal detachment, and one finds in the account of the episcopacy of Garnsworthy too much that is omitted or underplayed. This is especially true of episcopal elections, where in contrast with Hayes's analyses of the candidates and the issues, nothing is mentioned except the result of Garnsworthy's victory in 1968 ("in a closely-fought election," but with no mention of the other candidates or the issues) or Allan Read's in 1971 (where Black suggests that the synod voted contrary to expectation, and again the other candidates are not mentioned — both elections were fifth-ballot victories, and the other major candidates were Archdeacon Johnson and Canon Dann). It could be pointed out that in 1974 the Bishop of Keewatin (Hugh Stiff) was made Dean of Toronto; a much-needed third bishop was thus obtained for the diocese without an episcopal election. On page 132 he mentions the election of the three new regional bishops (in a single day — compare the marathons of 1879 and 1909), but does not name the regions. Nor is there mention of the proposal made during the late 1970s for a separate diocese in the Trent Valley region, which would have been a viable diocese in its own right and would have realized the last of Strachan's proposed dioceses ("Otonabee" — see p. 36). Although Black does highlight the concerns with many of the social issues of the day, Garnsworthy's crusade against the full funding of Roman Catholic separate schools receives only a brief mention on page 133, and nothing is said of the bishop's controversial trip to South Africa in 1979.

Of the succeeding chapters, that of Jones on church expansion is first rate, but all too brief, covering the growth from two churches in Toronto to the more than two hundred present parishes and dealing with the inevitable problem of a large diocese simultaneously rural and urban. This chapter should be used with his appendix on the parishes. There are a few errors — the founding of the congregation in Cobourg is 1819 and not 1822, the church founded in 1827 was that at Omemee not Lindsay, and the church that closed in 1977 was *St. Jude's*, Roncesvalles, which in fact became *St. Jude's*, Bramalea. The narrative of Jones's chapter is well handled, however, with both the spread of the church and the accompanying issues well explained (for example, the Tractarians vs Evangelicals). One is intrigued by the rectors/vicars problem, and wishes that more had been said about the problems created in Peterborough and in Barrie (the last as recent as 1935).

The chapters by Friesen and Ruggle (bewilderingly entitled "The Saints in the Land") deal with parishes and parish life in the periods 1780-1867 and 1867-1939. Friesen provides a clear account of almost all the issues (the problems facing Strachan, sponsorship, maintenance, priests and their duties, lay involvement, the role of the church society, etc.). Ruggle takes a similar line with the period to 1939, covering the role and *persona* of the parish priest, the spread of Christian organizations (which blossomed in the "middle" period), the changes in Christian worship, and social concern. In the last, Ruggle undercuts Hayes's more optimistic treatment, quoting a letter from the Cody papers: "The Diocesan social service is worse than useless for it does nothing but resolve things and hampers and chokes the church by inaction" (p. 212).

The editor's claim in the preface that the contributors returned to archival sources for their research seems to be confirmed for most of the chapters. The appendices contain the bulk of the hard data: Hayes in the first provides, with the beginning of an analysis, the statistics (demographic and financial) since 1883, correcting inaccuracies on a number of occasions, and Jones (Appendix III) lists all churches and congregations in the present diocesan area. In the second (all too brief) appendix, Mary-Anne Nicholls (the Diocesan Archivist) traces the history of the Diocesan Archives and lists the nine sorts of material contained therein (diocesan records, departmental records, parish registers, etc.). All of these (with the exception of music and pictorial plans) were used by the contributors along with such sources as newspapers (both secular and religious) and government statistics, including the census. Obviously the contributor's choice of subject will dictate the use of source material but, in taking at random Ruggle's chapter on parish life 1867-1939, this reviewer found a cornucopia of sources used: *Toronto Synod Journal*, three religious newspapers, two secular papers, eight parish histories, parish vestry minutes and magazines, personal papers (especially those of Cody and Sweeny), the archives of Trinity and Wycliffe Colleges, an unpublished manuscript, a scrap book, pastoral letters, the archives of the United Church and those of Lambeth Palace, and two legislative acts. More recent sections have relied (rather too much) on the various newspapers (*Canada Churchman*, *The Anglican*) and upon oral sources (Black's later chapter and Snell's short piece on the Anglican Congress is a personal reminiscence). Visual material appears in the various *St. James's* churches which adorn the cover and introduce the sections, and in sixteen pages of photographs of the ten diocesan bishops, a number of lay figures (chosen rather at random), and certain buildings and scenes from diocesan history. One is incorrectly labelled — *St. Paul's Yorkville* not *Yorkdale*. This reviewer noted also two typographical slips: "building" (p. 38) and 1878 for 1978 (p. 161, n. 32).

On the whole, *By grace co-workers* is an attractive and informative book to read. Certain areas have been overlooked. There is very little on liturgy and worship, and on the building and decoration of church buildings. Anyone looking for material on choirs, choir schools, and music in general will be disappointed; this integral part of the Anglican tradition deserved its own section. Although Peake does discuss church education in chapter nine, there was not enough about the relation between the Anglican church and public education, and hardly any mention of the Anglican private schools — Havergal and Ridley colleges occur in passing on page 150 — and nothing about St. George's College, located on what was to have been St. Alban's Cathedral, and mentioned only by Hayes as "a school" on the site. The fate of St. Alban's represents the diocese in miniature — a traditional form rejected, but now the chapel of a traditional Anglican school and also the home of St. Andrew's Japanese congregation. Certain individuals whom one might have expected to occupy a greater role in this history are inexplicably played down, such as the deans of the cathedral (Riley, Gilling, and Stiff), Canon Cody (almost invisible), and Dr. Eugene Fairweather. The volume does serve its purpose as a fine commemoration of the diocese's sesquicentennial, but too many shortcomings make it less than the definitive professional history.

Ian C. Storey
Trent University

A Heritage at Risk: Proceedings of the Evangelical Archives Conference. 13-15 July 1988. Billy Graham Centre, Wheaton College, Wheaton, Illinois. ii, 47 p.

The evangelical movement in North America is often viewed as a recent phenomenon and as a homogeneous body speaking with one voice on such controversial issues as pornography, public morals in education, the ordination of homosexuals, and abortion. But this popular image obscures the reality of a movement with deep roots in Protestant Christianity, with differing traditions in Canada and the United States, and with sharp contrasts among a variety of groups within the movement. Evangelicalism began as a renewal movement in eighteenth-century Protestant churches, and by the late twentieth century it has come to include not only renewal groups in mainline denominations but also more sectarian groups of fundamentalists, Pentecostals, and charismatics. Unfortunately, only a small amount of material documenting the rich and varied story of the evangelical community is being preserved in archives.

The difficulties in preserving records of evangelical groups are partly the result of the nature and structure of the movement itself, and partly the result of the more general problems associated with documenting nontraditional religious, political, social, and cultural movements in society. These difficulties, which are numerous and familiar to most archivists, include the scarcity of resources in evangelical organizations to support an archival programme. Additionally, the value of preserving and making accessible the records of their ministry is often not understood by those within the movement. Finally, many mainline church archives are struggling to meet the needs of their sponsoring institutions and do not have the resources to commit to the management of the records of either nondenominational evangelical organizations or evangelical groups within their own denominations. Misconceptions about the evangelical movement cannot fail to persist in circumstances which inhibit the preservation and study of its documentary record.