This book does not deal with archival principles or methodologies. Photos of most, but not all of the judges are included, as well as a few rare shots of courtroom scenes. The bibliography is succinct and select but does not include relevant material held by the Provincial Archives of Alberta subject to the province’s Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy legislation. The only reference works listed are The Canadian Gazette and The Dictionary of Canadian Biography. A section of the book lists all of the supreme court judges by name for specific periods of time, but not by locality or region, which would be useful. A list of district court judges is also included and stipulates districts up to 1935, but not after.

The authors maintain that a second edition of Lords of the Western Bench will soon be on its way, which “will provide a much more complete account of all the judges’ biographical information, the judges’ leading decisions, and the law espoused therein than is contained in this volume.” This may beg the question why this volume was released in the first place. Nonetheless, it is recommended for all legal historians of western Canada and some generalists too. The completion of the second edition may be delayed, for Rick Klumpenhouwer has now left the legal archival community and entered the medical one with his recent appointment as Records Manager for the Calgary Regional Health Authority. He joins Elizabeth Denham as Information and Privacy Coordinator and Donna Kynaston as Archivist. The lawyers’ loss will surely be the doctors’ gain. Will we see a compendium of Alberta’s chief physicians on the shelves soon?

David Leonard
Alberta Historic Sites


As Archivaria Book Review Editor, I ended up assigning myself the task of reviewing this work, as it is always a pleasure for me to read anything about the history of my home town, and Robert McDonald, a history professor at the University of British Columbia (UBC), does not disappoint. Making Vancouver is a complex and very detailed study of Vancouver in the first fifty years of its life, and in its use of primary sources nicely complements similar works, picking up where other authors (such as Margaret Ormsby and Patricia Roy) left off.

Although McDonald takes a scholarly approach to his subject, he makes clear in his introduction that he is focusing on “average people in local settings” (p. xiii), instead of political elites or national themes. Vancouver’s early history
has interested McDonald for a long time. Early in his research he encountered a shortage of records documenting turn-of-the-century Vancouver, such as fragmentary tax rolls, spotty church records, etc., which led him to create his own database of economic and social information on Vancouver’s leading businessmen. He analyzed this database for his doctoral thesis on Vancouver’s pre-World War I period, his goal being to apply to Vancouver a “structural approach to historical inquiry that characterized the ‘new urban history’” (p. xiii). However, finding the results somewhat incomplete—as he says, analyzing an elite group of businessmen did not shed much light on the rest of the population—he sought with this book to explore “the human side of urban life,” choosing to examine the impact of urbanization on relationships of class and status. He notes the tendency of Vancouver people, even in the city’s earliest days, to develop hierarchies of social status, quoting J.S. Woodsworth’s observation about Vancouverites: “So much of our time seems to be spent in distinguishing ourselves from our brethren. Wealth, social position, academic titles, dress—all are used to set one above [the other]” (p. xviii). Yet at the same time, Vancouver has always been a city in flux, retaining some of its frontier mentality, “a city being formed, not a city firmly established” (p. 53).

McDonald makes excellent use of archival sources, as well he should; he at one time taught the course on Canadian historiography and historical methods in the Master of Archival Studies programme at UBC (I was one of his students). His primary sources, from various repositories and including census and probate records, government correspondence, local newspapers, social registers, maps, photographs, and police arrest records, reveal many aspects of Vancouver society. He draws heavily from the Major Matthews Collection of photographs at the City of Vancouver Archives and acknowledges the help of City Archives staff in “unravelling the mysteries of the Matthews Collection” (p. x). The reader might well wonder what this means. In any case, J.S. Matthews, probably Vancouver’s most famous archivist, left us with an excellent collection of photographs, however mysterious their provenance or organization may be. I was intrigued by McDonald’s reference to a photograph of the early settlement of Granville which he says Matthews “later annotated.” McDonald does not explain what he means by “annotated,” and the reader is left to draw his or her own conclusions.

McDonald begins by describing the settlements of Granville and Moodyville, which had “congealed”—interesting choice of words!—around two sawmills on Burrard Inlet between the mid-1860s and mid-1880s (p. 3). McDonald paints a vivid picture of early settlement life in what became Vancouver, with its sawmills, rum mills, relatively large male population, and generally rough-and-ready atmosphere, describing how Burrard Inlet changed from a racially diverse settlement in the 1870s, with its mix of Europeans, natives, Asians, and blacks, to a community dominated by people of British origin by the turn of the century. The British settlers had a strong sense of stability and “respectability”;
to be respectable, you had to be part of a family unit, hard-working and self-sufficient, and able to show “tangible evidence of material progress” (p. 24). McDonald points out that British ethnicity linked Vancouver’s British population across class lines (p. 235); in other words, if you were of British background, you still “fit in,” more or less, even if you were not rich. However, “respectable” whites of British origin held mixed-blood people in low regard, and McDonald describes the extremely negative attitudes held by whites towards non-whites, citing Superintendent of Education correspondence as examples: “racial categorizations joined economic and social status as important sources of stratification at Burrard Inlet” (p. 25).

McDonald does a good job tracing Vancouver’s growth through these early years, from the strong influence of the CPR on the young city’s development and the founding of successful businesses such as B.C. Sugar, the rise of the trade unions, the growth of the suburbs and the “City Beautiful” movement of the early 1900s, to the real estate boom of the late nineteenth century and subsequent collapse before the outbreak of World War I. McDonald compares Vancouver’s economic ups and downs with those of other Canadian cities such as Winnipeg: “Winnipeg’s recession has been described as a reduction in the rate of expansion, rather than an ‘absolute decline’; Vancouver’s economy actually got smaller” (p. 147).

Real estate investment is nothing new in Vancouver, as McDonald makes clear, and those who dabbled in it took a “thrilling but brief ride to economic disaster” (p. 130). Businessman Francis Carter Cotton was among those who died insolvent, as probate records show. As McDonald points out, probate records “offer a glimpse of the scale and composition of society’s wealth” (p. 134), and indicate the worth of prominent Vancouver businessmen at the time of death. Those who were wealthy when they died tended to avoid real estate speculation, such as Benjamin T. Rogers, founder of B.C. Sugar, “an uncharacteristic Vancouver capitalist, [who] mainly avoided speculative investments and died a millionaire” (p. 135).

Business historians will be interested in McDonald’s analysis of the growth of Vancouver businesses, applying the model developed by American historian Alfred Chandler of the four stages of business structure: personal enterprise, entrepreneurial or family capitalism, financial capitalism, and managerial capitalism. B.C. Sugar was a good example of family capitalism, as were the various lumber companies.

The CPR, by contrast, provides an excellent example of monopoly capitalism. Its leaders helped establish Vancouver’s second Anglican congregation, Christ Church, and encouraged business and professional families to settle in Vancouver. As McDonald quotes, “in Vancouver the railway seemed to control everything” (p. 70). The CPR’s managers and their wives played a prominent role in Vancouver society, and McDonald shows how women could share the status of their husbands even if they didn’t share the political power (p. 88).
They could exert influence in other ways, such as hosting “at-homes” and organizing voluntary associations. For example, CPR manager Henry Abbott and his wife Margaret “quickly assumed the mantle of social leadership” (p. 70), with Henry founding the Vancouver Club and serving as president of the Boating Club and the Lawn Tennis Club, and Margaret acting as hostess to their friends and distinguished visitors.

After analyzing the wealthy business and professional class, McDonald turns to the artisan “or moderately well-to-do” class and, finally, to “the immigrant section,” although as he points out, the lives of less wealthy and prominent members of society were not as well documented and can therefore be more difficult to trace. Fortunately, photographs from the City Archives help provide a visual record of Vancouver’s work force, including bakers, longshoremen, telephone operators, loggers, fishermen, and construction labourers. These photographs speak volumes about the living and working conditions of Vancouver’s less fortunate inhabitants. I found it strange, however, that McDonald discusses native people in the chapter on immigrants! To be fair, he mentions them earlier in the book as well, and it could be that in “The Immigrant Section” he is comparing native people to non-British immigrants in terms of how they were all marginalized by white society.

McDonald also draws on Vancouver Police Department Prisoners’ Record Books, which “often tell more about perceptions of law and order at any given point than they do about actual criminal behaviour” (p. 227). They also reveal a certain “social anxiety,” for example, “periodic outbursts of concern” over such issues as prostitution; McDonald astutely observes that arrests made during these “outbursts” are “better described as ‘arrest waves’ than ‘crime waves’. As such they usefully illustrate social attitudes” (p. 227).

McDonald is a good writer, although his prose style tends to be rather dense at times; there is much to think about here, and his book is worth a close examination. 

*Making Vancouver* is a welcome addition to the study of this west-coast, uniquely Canadian city.

Anne Maclean
Victoria, B.C.

**Working Light: The Wandering Life of Photographer Edith S. Watson.**

I sat down to review Frances Rooney’s *Working Light: The Wandering Life of Photographer Edith S. Watson* with considerable interest, having never before heard of this turn-of-the-century woman photographer. According to the summary on the front end flap of the book, Watson travelled across Canada from