

The national register remedies all these weaknesses. It will include not only holdings of the National Archives as well as libraries, museums and historical societies, but also material in the custody of private individuals who are willing to grant access to researchers. The standards for entries were developed between 1975 and 1977 by a committee of the Archives Section of the New Zealand Library Association. Special mention should be made of the influence of Thomas Wilsted, Manuscripts Librarian of the Turnbull Library, who in 1975 suggested a new union catalogue or national register and was the first president of the Archives and Record Association of New Zealand (ARANZ) which was formed in 1976 and assumed responsibility for the project.

The plan of the register, based on the model of the loose leaf Australian guide to collections of manuscripts, is to produce installments of 250 entries and to combine four installments into a volume which will be published with an accumulated index. This first installment includes entries from 14 repositories but half of the entries are from Christchurch: the University of Canterbury Library (63) and Canterbury Public Library (54). The introduction refers to the individuals styles of contributors but the degree of uniformity indicates competent revision by the editorial committee. Each entry contains the name of the unit, inclusive dates, extent, location, description, access conditions, form if not original, name entries and finding aids.

It is evident that the looseleaf method, adopting a page for each entry, will result in a bulky series of volumes and unless the entries, particularly the biographical portions, are reduced, extensive and expensive published volumes. The Canadian Union List of Manuscripts in contrast averages twenty entries to each printed page. The index too is unusually extensive. Wilsted's claim that the principal aim was to provide access by time, geographical area and subject is valid. For example, under "Business and Industry" is listed all the regions in New Zealand and, under each, time periods with relevant entries for each. Under "Christchurch and Banks Peninsula" is listed all the subjects with dates and relevant entries. The index for only 250 entries thus builds to more than 30 pages with double columns—potentially quite bulky.

The fruition of this ambitious and valuable project redounds to the credit of the young national association of archivists which has sponsored it. It is a remarkable example of cooperation between the Turnbull Library, the National Archives and other New Zealand repositories. The register ought to promote more extensive use of archival material by researchers and is likely to be of interest to other countries who may find this a useful model for producing a comprehensive national guide to archives and manuscripts.

Wilfred I. Smith  
Public Archives of Canada

**Benjamin Baltzly. Photographs & Journal of an Expedition through British Columbia: 1871.** ANDREW BIRRELL. Toronto: Coach House Press, 1978. 159 p. ill. \$24.95.

**Great Days in the Canadian Rockies: The Photographs of Byron Harmon, 1906-1934.** Edited by CAROLE HARMON. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1978. 86 p. ill. ISBN 0 19 540288 X \$14.95.

Benjamin Baltzly was an early photographer of the British Columbia interior through the Fraser Canyon and up the North Thompson River to the Yellowhead Pass. In 1871, the year British Columbia entered Confederation, he accompanied a Geological Survey of

Canada expedition. His part in the expedition, and that of his assistant, John Hammond, was paid for by the renowned Montreal photographic studio of William Notman. Andrew Birrell, Head of Acquisition and Research, National Photography Collection, has provided a selection of the best available views made by Baltzly. A complete set of Baltzly's photographs does not exist; the author has included a list of all photographs taken, as well as the archival location and identification of each surviving image. Out of the 125 photographs listed by the Notman studio, the author has selected 71 photographs. The criteria for inclusion have not been set out by Birrell. It appears from the list of captions that all unique images have been reproduced and that the remaining 54 photographs are presumably duplicate views or inferior in terms of technical quality.

The Baltzly photographs are valuable primarily for their historical and geological/geographical statements. Their importance as artistic statements is secondary. Birrell has ignored, or possibly avoided for whatever reason, these aspects of history, geology/geography, and art. This catalogue approach is logical because it allows a viewer to make up his own mind; at the same time, it limits the value of the book as a research tool because other texts on the history and geography of British Columbia, and the Geological Survey, would have to be consulted before a viewer can appreciate the full impact of these images. Baltzly was not an art photographer, for his work was in the documentary tradition recently displayed in Ralph Greenhill's exhibition for the National Gallery of Canada, "Documentary Photography in Canada, 1850-1920." Nevertheless, Baltzly did take photographs which show an awareness of correct lighting and composition for landscape work.

The photograph of Lytton (plate 14) is a typical example of the town view, a semi-aerial shot from a high vantage point which allows the entire town to be seen against the backdrop of the Thompson River where it joins the Fraser. Unfortunately, no evidence is presented by Birrell to suggest whether John Hammond's painter's background had anything to do with certain artistic qualities found in some of Baltzly's photographs. Baltzly's photographs do not appear to be directly linked to a landscape school of art which flourished in Canada and the United States from about 1860 to 1890. This fascinating relationship between Canadian painting and photography has recently been explored in Ann Thomas' catalogue to the McCord Museum exhibition, *Fact and Fiction: Canadian Painting and Photography, 1860-1900*, and in Denis Reid's book *"Our Own Country Canada"* (National Gallery of Canada, 1979).

Although Birrell's book is the first to document the work of any nineteenth century photographer working in British Columbia—and the second book in the Early Canadian Photographers series—the images are not "easily the best done in British Columbia during the decade," as Birrell states in his introduction. This is an opinion which is unsupported by any comparative evidence, let alone the opinions of other photographic historians and critics. The critical nineteenth century response to the Baltzly photographs, which were sold under the Notman studio imprint, is also lacking from Birrell's book. Yet, what makes this book particularly valuable is the inclusion of Baltzly's journal of his part in the expedition. This document, published in *The Gazette* (Montreal) in 1872, provides some interpretation of the photographs. Birrell has corrected factual errors and commented upon some discrepancies between Baltzly's account and that of Alfred R.C. Selwyn's report, the director of the Geological Survey and the leader of the 1871 expedition. Birrell has also footnoted the references in Baltzly's journal to the photographs in the portfolio section.

*Benjamin Baltzly*, in an edition of 2,000, appears destined for the reference shelves of archives and libraries. It is an excellent example of Coach House Press's book production skills. All photographs are reproduced in duotone one per page and are sepia-toned to resemble the original albumen prints. All the stereo views have been printed larger than the original size and only one half of the view has been used. Part of an 1871 map with a

tracing of the expedition's route has been included as well. There is no index to the book. *Benjamin Baltzly* will probably remain the definitive collection of his views, but doubtless other photographic historians and critics will come forth in due time with differing opinions about Baltzly's importance in the history of Canadian photography. Birrell's book will be a primary reference for those engaged in the ongoing construction of the history of Canadian photography.

On a different order entirely is Carole Harmon's book about her grandfather's photographs, *Great Days in the Rockies*. Byron Harmon, like Benjamin Baltzly, was a commercial photographer and one who is best remembered for his landscape work. Harmon was a prolific photographer who came to Banff in 1903 and photographed the Rocky Mountains of Canada until near the end of his life in 1942 at the age of 66. His collection of 6,500 negatives are now in the Archives of the Canadian Rockies. It is from this life work that his granddaughter selected the images which she feels best represents Byron Harmon's skills at capturing that elusive mountain light. Byron Harmon was quite clearly interested in the mountains for artistic reasons first and for commercial reasons second. He attempted to portray the grandeur of the Rockies and the Selkirks, and the minuteness of man against that majestic landscape, through the use of long shots, careful posing, and backlightings. Equally at home with a movie camera as with a still camera, his photographs and film footage earned him an international reputation in his own lifetime as a mountain photographer. It is unfortunate that we are not told who the other comparable mountain photographers were, including those who preceded Harmon both in Canada and elsewhere.

*Great Days in the Rockies* is primarily a commentary upon Byron Harmon's photographs as the epitome of mountain photographic art. Bart Robinson, author of two books on the Rockies and Banff, provides a useful biography of the photographer; Jon Whyte, a director of the Peter and Catharine Whyte Foundation which manages the Archives of the Canadian Rockies, writes a lucid appreciation of Harmon's work. It is Whyte's essay which furnishes the key to the Harmon images, and, therefore, although presented last, his essay should be read first. The strong supporting texts for the Harmon images have been undercut by a poor printing job. The plates are all duotones, but careless handling of the screens has caused many of the photographs to blur as though they are out of focus. Presentation of the images is through division into sections that supposedly reflect the photographer's work as well as his photographic interests. The time span covered is from 1906 to 1934.

The weakest section is the second one, entitled "Along the Line of the CPR." The photographs chosen are from a very narrow area through which the Canadian Pacific rail line runs and the selection simply does not do justice to the superb scenery in that part of the Rockies. The timeless landscape photographs of some nineteenth century photographers who worked this region—for instance, William M. Notman, S.J. Thompson, R.H. Trueman, C.S. Bailey, Richard Maynard, and Boorne & May—are far more interesting than what is shown here as representative of Harmon's work. The section titled "The Wilderness" is something of a misnomer and a catch-all, since it includes photographs taken on the Columbia Icefield Expedition in 1924, a subject which is covered in the last section under that name. There are some mediocre and downright bad photographs in "The Wilderness," particularly plates 61 (silhouette of a dog-sled against a hillside), 62 (no definition in dark areas; figure in foreground not visible), and 63 (cluttered and lacking in visual impact because foreground out of focus). Plates 58 and 59 depict the same subject matter, the skinning of a mountain goat (not the same one, but then who needs to look at this twice?). The expectations fostered by the texts have not been met by the choice of photographs. There is a sense of frustration when, for instance, looking at plate 15, "Two men looking up at a hanging glacier," we can barely discern one of the men. The second, because of his white shirt sleeve, is at least somewhat visible. The ordinary

snapshot quality of plate 27, "Bathers at the Cave and Basin, Banff," as well as many others, belies Whyte's assertion that the photographs "are rich in style."

This noble attempt to portray Byron Harmon as a photographer who is relevant beyond his time has failed because the photographs selected do not reflect the praise lavished upon them. *Great Days in the Rockies* will appeal to mountaineers and naturalists; it will also deserve comparison from a photographic viewpoint with the images of other mountain photographers. It will surely provide much material for debate on the aesthetic quality of photographs intended for commercial sale.

David Mattison  
Columbia College Library

**Krieghoff.** J. RUSSELL HARPER. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, © 1979. xvi, 204 p. ISBN 0 8020 2348 7 \$29.95.

There are in Canada two types of art books. The most well known are the showy Christmas massives, characterized by glossy plates which overwhelm a text based upon parasitic research and are not meant to be read. A second type, characterized by a concern with research and by illustrations which exist to complement a text, is as far from the first as Homer is from Harlequin. These books, using archival and other sources, make a significant contribution to knowledge as well as superficial appreciation. The footnoted sources are the test of quality: if solid archival research is present, it is scholarship; if not, it is Christmas puffery. Leading examples of the second type are Mellon's *Group of Seven*, Reid's *Group of Seven*, Hill's *Canadian Painting in the Thirties*, and Tippet's *Emily Carr*. J. Russell Harper stands as a doyen of this genre—a researcher of assiduity, a writer of erudition, a scholar of judgement.

Cornelius Krieghoff is an elusive subject. We have a great many more documents from his brush than from his pen. With "all too many tantalizing gaps" in the written sources, "the paintings themselves must thus be the foundation for a book about him." In short, the written material does not reach monographic proportions and the biographical account must be fleshed out with intelligent probabilities, reasonable must-haves, and anecdotal accounts from contemporary literary sources. Where the pictures can inform about Krieghoff as painter and person, Harper extracts the information with practiced skill. He then uses them as social and cultural documents, coupling them to contemporary accounts and popular vignettes. This double evidence (written and visual) and double use (life and times) does not always result in perfect marriages.

Harper's Preface is a valuable and revealing essay on the problems of Krieghoff scholarship as well as on the author's method of dealing with it. He is clearly concerned with using all available written sources and, especially for the early years, he has uncovered some valuable new ones. But so much of the evidence about Krieghoff is hearsay, so little documentable, and Harper is too scrupulous to allow the two to be confused. He tells us what is verifiable, what is unverifiable yet possible, and what is undocumented and improbable.

The book is largely written as a biographical account, reinforced with social and historical examination of the paintings and their subjects. Harper has diligently traced Krieghoff's early life in Holland and Germany by on-site research. He follows the artist to the United States, to Toronto, Montreal and Quebec, finally to Chicago. His illustrations are rich, well-selected, and aptly used. They come from a tireless search for Krieghoffs that raised the number of known works by about fifty percent and bring us closer to Harper's goal of a *catalogue raisonné*. A chapter on "Misattributions, Deceptions, and Forgeries" is particularly engaging—and the only such piece dealing with this problem in Canadian