

Indeed, in writing his thesis, on which the present book is so largely based, Dempsey would have been able to consult only some of the case records (for example, those of soldiers known to have been killed). Over the past decade, however, the CEF personnel files have been opened to research. Their indexes are now available to a wide audience through the National Archives web site ([www.archives.ca](http://www.archives.ca)). Dempsey does not make clear the extent to which information from his 1987 thesis has been supplemented for the present publication by evidence from the material opened in the intervening twelve years. Readers can only make an informed judgment on an author's conclusions when they possess a full knowledge of the sources upon which those conclusions are based. As it is, we are left unsure as to whether Dempsey's findings reflect as the fullest use of the case file record possible.

*Warriors of the King* should be seen as a major contribution to the study of a too often overlooked aspect of military and First Nations history. It is a handsome book which includes fifteen illustrations from the Glenbow Archives and from the author's personal collection. One in particular, an image of a cowhide robe decorated by Mike Mountain Horse in the traditional manner of the Blood Tribe and depicting his experiences, is an especially evocative record. Such a fine regional analysis only whets the appetite for comparative views of the First World War experiences of the First Nations of Atlantic Canada, central Canada, and the Pacific Coast. A wealth of source material awaits, as rich as that which Dempsey has mined for his study of prairie Indians.

**Bill Russell**

National Archives of Canada

**In Search of Geraldine Moodie.** DONNY WHITE. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center, 1998. 182 p. ISBN 0-88977-109-x.

In publishing the monograph *In Search of Geraldine Moodie*, Donny White has taken a significant step towards the reassertion of the photographer Geraldine Moodie's rightful place in history. White has explored various collections, both private and institutional, during the seventeen years of research that went into the production of the book, then pieced together the various photographs, letters, and public records in an effort to reconstruct Moodie's legacy. He has made good use of an array of sources. His broad search through scattered collections, from the British Museum to those of Moodie's great-granddaughters, has brought to light a selection of Moodie's work that might have remained buried for decades longer had he not invested the time and effort. Indeed, White does researchers, and casual readers, a great service: many of the images have been in storage for almost one hundred years, while many more have never enjoyed wide circulation.

Unfortunately, his choice of format – narrative biographical sketches corresponding essentially to periods in Moodie’s life and inserted as chapters in between large numbers of photographic reproductions – has certain drawbacks. His research touches primarily on Moodie’s business endeavours, family, and experiences as the wife of a Northwest Mounted Police officer. This emphasis on the biographical aspect of Moodie’s legacy, while it creates an interesting character in the person of the photographer, diverts attention from her professional status. White may have intended to show the images unhampered by theory and accessible to a wide readership, but his decision to present photographs from a complex and significant period in the country’s evolution with only minimal references to the historical context has a significant effect on the reader’s understanding of Moodie’s practice. While issues of gender bias and the relationships between white photographers and Native subjects are inherently part of Moodie’s story, this book does little to address them. White’s almost total exclusion of context and analysis greatly affects the publication, primarily an illustrated life story largely devoid of critical insight. A thorough examination of Moodie’s photography would have better honoured her memory by looking at the impact of her work. Instead, White has chosen to devote much of the book to an investigation of what he finds to be an “exceptional personality,” one that is “an apparent anomaly for her time.” This focus on the photographer’s life story is not unique to this book or to White’s work. It is apparent in many similar historical sketches (Henri Robideau’s 1995 book *Flapjacks and Photographs: The Life Story of the Famous Camp Cook and Photographer Mattie Gunterman* is an example); but this type of focus can be problematic. Perhaps because there are more sources of information for Moodie’s personal life than for her professional development, the book gives more insight into the changes in the Moodie family than the ways in which her photography evolved. For instance, her relationships with her grandmother Susanna Moodie and great-aunt Catherine Parr Trail are accorded more attention than is her choice of camera or change in photographic genre.

The specter of Moodie’s gender is a particular focus of the biographical information. In his introduction, White briefly explains the origin of his interest in the photographer, writing of his “delight” in discovering that the “G. Moodie” whose signature appeared at the bottom of a striking photograph “was in fact Geraldine Moodie, the wife of the Mounted Policeman, John Douglas Moodie.” Although he pays justifiable attention to the difficulties that Moodie would have experienced as a woman raising six children and maintaining a professional photographic practice around the turn of the century, his choice of language is sometimes awkward. While he seems fascinated by the gender bias against Moodie both in the historical period and in the present, his repeated description of her practice as something with which she “busied herself” detracts from the stature of her work.

A more serious bias is apparent in White's suggestion that Moodie was more sensitive to her subjects, particularly the native sitters, than were her male colleagues. Indeed, in an attempt to redeem the problematic history of exploitative relationships, some researchers have been tempted to portray white women photographers as being comparatively sympathetic to their native subjects. White is in danger of doing the same thing here. In discussing Moodie's portraiture practice in the nearby Cree and Inuit communities, he mentions her particular empathy for her subjects. But this approach is not always obvious in her work. Both the images and excerpts from letters indicate that it was Moodie's astute business sense, rather than any aspect of her moral character, that prompted her interest in photographing native life.

White includes an excerpt drawn from her personal correspondence (a rare example of Moodie's own words) that reveals her sensibility. To her great-aunt she writes, "I have not seen much of the Indians this spring. I have several promises to come and sit for their pictures when I get my new studio and fixtures finished." This suggests that it was she who sought out the Native sitters rather than they who came in to have portraits made. Furthermore, as White points out, Moodie quite consistently copyrighted her photographs with the intention of selling them. Certainly she copyrighted many of the photographs made during the Moodies' posting to the Eastern Arctic – "the most interesting pictures [being] those of the natives," superintendent Moodie noted. Her intent was to shop them around to various government departments.

The images themselves, when closely examined, show evidence that when Moodie made photographs her approach was not necessarily sentimental or sensitive. A series of images of a prairie Sun Dance ceremony is one example. While White suggests that Moodie "chronicled the celebration from a female perspective and included views of women and family groupings that would not have interested her male counterparts," there is little support for the argument in photographs of the event. In fact, two images, on pages eighteen and twenty, show clear resentment on the part of the subjects, who are photographed gesturing at her camera or hiding their faces.

Further, without acknowledging the issue of racial tensions prevalent at the time of the photographs' making, the inclusion of certain of Moodie's postcard images and studio portraits risks reaffirming negative stereotypes associated with Aboriginal cultures during that period. While a portrait of a young Cree woman and child (found on the back cover and again on page fifty-eight) seems to uphold White's argument (again, that Moodie's gender made her sensitive to such subjects), a third reproduction of the photo disputes that claim. This appears on page thirty-eight as part of a composite postcard design from 1897 highlighting the NWMP presence on the prairies. It is positioned above the title "A Dusky Mother." The lack of any comment regarding the different contexts in which the photograph was presented means that the message behind the 1897 postcard stands undisputed. Similarly, on another page of the

book, White has placed a group portrait of Sun Dance participants above an excerpt from an 1895 edition of *The Saskatchewan Herald* that pointedly notes the absence of torture in contrast to former such ceremonies. Again, without any reinterpretation of the image the negative connotation remains.

Despite these drawbacks, White's book does present a selection of Moodie's most compelling photographs from diverse phases of her photographic career. This gives the reader a concise but rich sample of the photographer's work. Moreover, although the quality of the reproductions varies, *In Search of Geraldine Moodie* gives readers a chance to see images that have been unavailable to the public for almost a century. There are myriad paths into history that these images provide and this publication will spark further interest in Moodie's work and that of other historical photographers.

**Sherry Newman**  
Ottawa, Ontario

**Academic Freedom in Canada: A History.** MICHIEL HORN. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999. xv, 446 p. ISBN 0-8020-0726-0.

If one sentence could possibly summarize this prodigious yet highly readable *tour de force*, this would be my choice, quoted from the *Canadian Forum*, June 1939: "Although professors are always told that they have the full right of free speech, it has often been made plain to them that they should exercise that right in silence." The price of liberty, as Michiel Horn of York University's Glendon College History Department might have concluded, is that of eternal vigilance. Many of the long-ago battles for academic freedom described evoke familiar names – Frank Underhill, Eugene Forsey, and Harry Crowe, to name but three. And several cases of much more recent vintage demonstrate that academic freedom is still a moving target: political correctness and the Royal Ontario Museum's "Out of Africa" exhibition; Dr. Nancy Olivieri's experiences at the University of Toronto and Hospital for Sick Children; business schools' responses to the siren song of corporate "partnerships"; and so forth.

Horn reminds us that academic freedom has traditionally encompassed two discrete ideas: the freedom for professors to do their work, and the preservation of universities from external control. While acknowledging that the latter is no less critical, it is the former that here concerns him. Horn argues how "professors have invoked academic freedom in order to free themselves from religious tests, to resist the authority of administrators and boards, to claim independence in their research, to control the content of their courses, to be judged by their peers and not by outsiders, and to be assessed on their achievements and not their beliefs."